

# PUBLIC PERSONNEL REVIEW

*The Quarterly Journal of the  
Civil Service Assembly of the United States and Canada*

VOLUME 8

JULY, 1947

Number 3

## CONTENTS

	PAGE
STAFFING AN INTERNATIONAL AGENCY. . . . .	Robert I. Biren 123
HANDLING EMPLOYEE GRIEVANCES IN WICHITA . . . . .	Russell E. McClure and Hugo Wall 127
WAGE NEGOTIATIONS IN THE TENNESSEE VALLEY AUTHORITY . . . . .	Harry L. Case 132
THE ILLINOIS STATE IN-SERVICE TRAINING PROGRAM . . . . .	Robert L. Hunter 138
THE PUBLIC-RELATIONS VALUE OF THE ANNUAL REPORT . . . . .	Oscar Richard 144
CIVIL SERVICE IN OREGON— A TWO-YEAR PROGRESS REPORT . . . . .	William G. Colman and Robert R. Johnson 151
LEGAL NOTES . . . . .	H. Eliot Kaplan 162
THE BOOKSHELF:	
Measuring and Rating Employee Value . . . . .	Charles A. Meyer 171
Selective Job Placement . . . . .	Foster Roser 172
The Social System of the Modern Factory . . . . .	Henry Reining, Jr. 173
Elements of Public Administration . . . . .	Karl A. Bosworth 175
CURRENT LITERATURE ABSTRACTS . . . . .	177

Copyright 1947, by the Civil Service Assembly

### *Editorially speaking . . .*

• How would you set about staffing one of the United Nations organizations? Into how many languages, for example, would you translate your application forms and tests? Robert Biren, in his article **Staffing An International Agency**, covers some of the problems encountered in the Food and Agriculture Organization of UN, and points clearly to the conclusion that international personnel administration adds a

fourth dimension to our hitherto-simple world of local-state-federal relations.

• In Wichita, Kansas, grievances of city employees are handled in no haphazard fashion. A clear-cut policy of the city administration plus an effectively functioning organization provide ready means for airing dissatisfaction and seeking a remedy. Russell McClure and Hugo Wall give a

detailed description of the plan in their article, **Handling Employee Grievances in Wichita.**

- Dealing collectively with employees is one of the basic features of personnel management in the Tennessee Valley Authority—a region with boundaries in half a dozen states. When thirty management representatives and a hundred union representatives gather around the conference table annually to reach agreement on pay rates for the coming year—and when both parties go away satisfied—that's news. How TVA has been able to accomplish this year after year is told by Harry Case in his article, **Wage Negotiations in the Tennessee Valley Authority.**

- Says Robert Hunter, president of the Illinois state civil service commission: "More than 5,000 employees . . . representing practically every department . . . have participated in the state's in-service training program in the last three years." How this program has burgeoned from a modest start to a major phase of the state personnel program is told by Mr. Hunter in **The Illinois State In-Service Training Program.**

- Too many personnel agencies turn out stereotyped reports year after year, bur-

dened with raw statistics and over-cooked text. Oscar Richard in his down-to-earth article, **The Public Relations Value of the Annual Report**, gives a wealth of practical suggestions for improving the annual report and for making it an effective medium for gaining public support. After you have read his article, get out your last report from the files and look it over with a critical eye!

- In 1945, Oregon adopted a comprehensive state civil service law and embarked on the task of putting the law into operation. Now, after two years, William Colman and Robert Johnson look back over the installation period and recount it in their thought-provoking article, **Civil Service in Oregon—A Two-Year Progress Report.**

- A special committee of the United States Civil Service Commission has recently issued its closing report, entitled "Improvements in Methods of Presentation of Specifications with the Objective of Achieving Better Uniformity Within Series and Across Series Lines." We had hardly gotten into reading the title of this closing report when we caught ourselves wondering how many committee members had to sit on the cover to get it closed.

# Staffing an International Agency

ROBERT I. BIREN

THE OPERATING PROGRAMS of the international agencies which constitute the United Nations secretariat and specialized agencies are only beginning to be made clear. The effort to cover the major phases of world relations in a series of special-purpose organizations is particularly difficult in the beginning phases, when the adequacy of coverage and the avoidance of overlapping require detailed and continuous program analyses. In addition, the internal programs of these organizations must be carefully examined for consistency with whatever legislative mandates exist and with financial resources, as well as with the programs of other agencies. The great problem of staffing these organizations is, therefore, one of attempting to obtain complete and accurate program definitions and to translate these into personnel needs. The solution of this primary difficulty lies outside the scope of this paper, but it must be kept in mind as an influencing factor in reviewing the more technical aspects of the staffing problem.

## *Staffing: A Three-fold Problem*

THE TECHNICAL PROBLEMS involved in recruiting and selecting the staff of an international agency may be summarized under three main heads: the necessity for maintaining an international character in the staff of the organization concerned; the inapplicability of many common selection processes in an international frame of reference; and the difficulty of equating employment terms and conditions on an international scale.

• ROBERT I. BIREN is presently Director of Organization and Personnel of the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations. He was formerly on the staff of Public Administration Service, and before that worked for the U. S. Navy Department and the states of Minnesota and Michigan.

The views expressed in this paper are those of the author and do not represent official attitudes of FAO or any of the other UN organizations.

Adequate solutions to these problems are made more difficult by the scarcity of guide lines based on experience in international administration of the scope of the newly formed agencies of the United Nations group. There exist neither definitive mandates, in a form corresponding to national legislation, concerning staff operations of international agencies, nor any central staff agencies charged with the functions of planning and coordinating agency staff functions. In addition, the difficulties imposed by language differences tend to slow up administrative processes and impede progress in formulating operating procedures.

This difference in languages is not, however, so great a barrier to the solution of administrative problems as are the wide variations in concept among the various nations (and therefore, ordinarily, among the various nationals) concerning the proper scope of authority of staff agencies, their relationships with operating units, and so on. The administrative technician who possesses only a superficial knowledge of comparative administrative philosophies and methods is struck by the variance or even contradiction in the administrative programs which have apparently gained acceptance in major nations of the world. The international staff technician must possess or acquire an unusual open-mindedness and tolerance concerning "principles of administration." Philosophically, this may be an admirable state of affairs; from an operating point of view, it does not contribute to getting on with things.

A final general observation which merits some attention before a more detailed discussion of the major staffing difficulties mentioned above concerns the haste with which most of the international agencies have been organized in order to meet responsibilities imposed on them by their legislative bodies, the assemblies or con-

ferences of national representatives. Based on national and local activity in organizing agencies of comparable size, the international organizations have, perhaps, not moved rapidly. But when the various problems which have already been mentioned here are taken into consideration, particularly the need for defining substantive programs to avoid duplication of efforts, the changing world picture and, therefore, changing demands on these agencies, the necessary delay in the meeting of legislative bodies and committees, and so on, the tempo of organization has, in fact, been remarkably rapid.

All this means that the often repeated remark concerning "sailing a ship while building it" is applicable to a remarkable degree. The figure might well be expanded to include the concepts that the officers of the ship are being required to study new methods of navigation as they sail, to transmit orders in strange tongues, and, finally, that they must proceed full speed over an unknown course to a none-too-well-defined destination.

#### *Maintaining the International Character of the Staff*

MANY OF THE PROBLEMS inherent in attempting to recruit and select a truly international staff are apparent; others escape pre-analysis and manifest themselves only upon experience. Some definition of "satisfactory" international staffing is necessary so that goals may be set for the procedures in this area. Unfortunately, except in the broadest and, therefore, least helpful terms, such a definition is extremely hard to develop. International agencies should have on their staffs nationals of a wide variety of countries, certainly from all major world regions; insofar as practicable some staff should come from each member nation; actual staff distribution should be in accord with some reasonable and appropriate criterion. Beyond such generalizations as these, there is little definite philosophy on the subject.

Prior experience with the problem is of little aid. The League of Nations limited the number of higher level appointments

which nationals of any major country might occupy at any one time. This rather negative control is hardly applicable in the dynamic atmosphere of the United Nations. The federal government of the United States has an apportionment system which divides appointments among the several states on the basis of population. Aside from the patent inadequacy of utilizing of population as the sole factor in allocating staff among member nations of tremendously varying sizes, the experience of the United States with this scheme has resulted in the introduction of so many exceptions that it can hardly be said to be in effect.

The criterion most often advanced for determining staff distribution is that of financial contributions to the organization concerned. This concept is, of course, attacked with considerable vigor by those nations whose resources, population pressures, and war experiences have made it impossible for them to make significant financial contributions to international organizations.

Another factor which tends to make difficult or impossible the formulation of an adequate "quota" system is the recognition, formally or informally, of the fact that some regions or countries have given greater attention, through research and development, to some program areas. To specify any of these areas might engender unhappy arguments, but the fact remains that some techniques or entire sciences have been highly developed in some areas and neglected in others. Throughout the entire range of international activities, this situation might not greatly affect national or regional representation, but in small individual program organizations the result can be quite unhappy.

OTHER ELEMENTS of the staff distribution problem relate to the location of the organization headquarters and to the staff distribution required by the use of certain languages as working tools of the agencies. It has become fairly well accepted that the great majority of the "lower staff" in any organization will come from the host country.



The inadvisability of systematically recruiting messengers, clerks, and custodial employees on a world-wide basis is readily apparent. But what is occasionally overlooked is the fact that a considerable proportion of the intermediate and higher administrative staff will necessarily also come from nationals of the host country or, at least, will be persons with long experience therein. If a majority of staff are locally recruited, most of those who are responsible for such recruitment and for dealing with staff problems must be familiar with local employment resources and customs. Similarly, housing the agency requires a knowledge of local facilities, including transportation, which makes the choice of host country nationals almost imperative for this function. Purchasing of equipment and supplies, most communications administration, and even travel arrangements, call for experience in these fields at the site of the organization headquarters.

The languages in which the agency works obviously affect the distribution of staff. As in the case of recruiting lower staff locally and the staffing implications thereof, the purely linguistic group should be abstracted in any critical examination of the effective geographic distribution of staff. Again, the use of a particular language group—and, therefore, usually of particular nationals—affects more than the immediate area of translation or interpretation. The preparation and distribution of organization documents, conference administration and similar items are closely related to language usage, and some staff in these areas will necessarily be chosen because of language abilities.

There are other elements of the staff distribution problem, but to detail them might lead to the conclusion that the problem is insoluble and that the possibilities of creating truly international organizations are remote. This is not the case. Satisfactory staff distributions are being approached by many of the agencies, and with good sense, vigilance, and an awareness of the complexities involved, better distributions will be achieved.

### *Applicability of Accepted Recruitment and Selection Devices*

THOSE WHO ARE CHARGED with recruiting staff for international organizations must realize early in their efforts that they are barred from using many of the techniques utilized in national and local governmental organizations. It is plain that the advances in psychometrics will not be made applicable to world-wide selection processes for a considerable time. New interviewing techniques will not be of material aid in selection processes ordinarily carried on mainly by mail or even by telegraph. Personality inventories and occupational interest blanks must be standardized in a dozen tongues before the international recruiter will find them of assistance.

The fact seems to be that the selection of personnel for international agencies will for some time be made on the basis of analysis of applications, reference and collateral investigations, and, when practicable, personal interviews. These are, in general, the devices which have been considered the weakest of those used for personnel selection. It might well follow that selection results would be generally unsatisfactory. On an absolute basis, perhaps, results have been and will continue to be less satisfactory than the importance of the functions deserve. But relatively, and considering the difficulties encountered in the process, results have been better than might have been expected.

The purposes and aims of the United Nations and the specialized agencies have fired the imagination of the world, and thousands of individuals have indicated their willingness to contribute to the realization of the ideals of world cooperation. Governments have made leading technical and administrative experts available to counsel the new agencies and assist in getting them under way. Recognizing the importance of the United Nations, technical groups, universities, governments, and industry representatives have made recommendations of suitable candidates and have replied promptly, in detail, and with apparent judgment and frankness to reference inquiries. There is considerable rea-

son to believe that the accuracy of reference replies increases with the level of the referee, and the replies of men to whom inquiries have been directed on candidates for major international posts tend to substantiate this view. The personal histories of candidates have been subjected to searching scrutiny and cross-checking in an effort to increase the accuracy and reliability of the selection process. In addition, some progress has been made in establishing standards for international positions or, more often, to adapt standards in effect in comparable national governmental or industrial operations.

It must be admitted, however, that the selection standards of international organizations must be improved through the utilization of the most modern and effective methods in this field if maximum results are to be obtained. There is considerable hope that the necessary research may be made possible under the sponsorship of the agency to be set up under the UN General Assembly resolution calling for an International Civil Service Commission. Some work has already been done on defining the scope and organization of this agency, tentatively renamed the International Personnel Advisory Board.

#### *Equating Employment Conditions*

A PROBLEM encountered in any large-scale national personnel administration is that of offering employment terms which are as attractive and meaningful to candidates from widely varying regions. Even within a country, regional differences in pay, leave, and working hours standards lead to some confusion and difficulty in recruiting. On a national basis, these differences are ordinarily not so great as to create major problems. In any case, national policy usually requires that no recognition be given to such regional differences.

The differences in traditions between various world regions in these matters are greater and more serious in their effect on operating recruiting programs. Some countries consider government or inter-governmental employment as carrying sufficient prestige to make high pay unnecessary. In

other areas, government employment is very well paid. Hours of work vary greatly, and special privileges in the form of children's allowances, home, sick, and annual leave, housing allowances, and so on, are often encountered in different forms and degrees. Candidates for international posts naturally think in terms of their own environment and tend to seek the conditions to which they are accustomed. This situation makes negotiations with potential employees difficult, and raises numerous problems in the formulation of employment regulations.

It may be expected that some standardization will eventually be obtained in employment conditions and that these standards will, through publicity and experience, gain acceptance in participating countries as appropriate for international employment. Meanwhile, those charged with responsibilities in these fields will have to maintain such flexibility as is possible in order to meet their recurring operating problems in this area.

#### *Conclusion*

STAFFING an international organization in the dynamism of today's efforts at creating an effective series of world agencies presents a variety of problems different in degree and, in some cases, in kind from those encountered in operations at a national or local level. Efforts are being made to develop effective policies to solve these problems, and the possibility of a cooperative attack on them offers promise of reasonable success.

The programs of the international agencies cannot, however, wait upon the study and research required for adequate answers to the questions raised here. The character and effectiveness of these agencies for years to come is now being determined. It is sincerely to be hoped that the cooperation already in evidence in aiding these agencies to seek out and select competent staff, the generally favorable employment conditions they offer, and the incentives to superior effort inherent in international employment, will compensate for technical deficiencies of immediate staffing programs.

# Handling Employee Grievances in Wichita . . . . .

RUSSELL E. McCLURE

AND HUGO WALL

ANY METHOD of dealing with grievances and complaints must be understood and evaluated against the background of the formal governmental machinery and the political and administrative traditions of the jurisdiction in which it operates. It becomes necessary at the outset, therefore, to inquire briefly into the governmental machinery and traditions in Wichita.

## *Organization for Personnel Administration*

A CENTRAL personnel office, managed by a supervisor who is appointed by and responsible to the city manager, administers the merit system for the city's three independent appointing authorities—the city manager, who supervises approximately 75 per cent of the city employees; the board of park commissioners; and the library board. Included as an integral part of the personnel program are an employees' council and a personnel advisory board. The personnel supervisor serves as secretary to both agencies.

*The Employees' Council.* The employees' council is composed of twenty-one employees elected annually by the employees of the various departments and divisions. Department and division heads are ineligible for election. The employees' council functions, according to the personnel manual, are: (1) to investigate, consider, and report, or make recommendations on matters pertaining to the general welfare of employees of the city; (2) upon request of the appointing authority, to advise the ap-

pointing authority concerning personnel problems; (3) to consider personnel policies and problems submitted to it by the personnel director; and (4) to elect a representative to the personnel advisory board. The council was thus designed primarily as a device for top management to convey overall policies to employees, and to receive expressions of employee opinion. It is not an organization for collective bargaining, nor is the council a grievance committee.<sup>1</sup>

Working within the framework of powers set up in the personnel manual, and in close cooperation with the personnel office, the council has taken over the leadership of many employee activities. The nature of council activities is indicated by the committees which it has set up. These are: (1) employee welfare; (2) employee training; (3) employee safety; (4) employee recreation; and (5) community welfare. A sixth committee, named the legislative committee, has concerned itself with procuring state enabling legislation to permit establishing a municipal employee retirement system.

In some of the larger departments and divisions, it became an onerous task for the council members representing those units to acquaint the employees of those units with the decisions reached by the employees' council. Also, community welfare activities, such as seeing employees and obtaining their contributions to the Community Chest, placed a heavy burden on council members. Hence, to help council members thus overburdened, twelve departmental committees were established. Perhaps the reader should be cautioned that

• RUSSELL E. McCLURE is city manager for the city of Wichita, having served in this capacity since 1941. The present merit system of personnel administration has been developed under his direction.

• HUGO WALL is chairman of the personnel advisory board for the city of Wichita. He is professor and head of the department of political science at the University of Wichita.

<sup>1</sup> The organization and early activities of the employees' council are described by Russell E. McClure and Elder Gunter in "An Experiment in Employer-Employee Relations." *Public Management*, July 1944, p. 194-97.

"departmental committee" is somewhat of a misnomer because some of these committees include a single division.

The size of a committee, and the method of selecting its membership is determined by the employees of the division or department being served by it. Hence, some committees are appointed by the council member with whom the committee works; others are elected by the employees of the unit served by the committee. The committees also vary in size from three to seven persons, roughly in proportion to the number of employees in the division or department.

In practice, these departmental committees have not only aided the employees' council members in carrying out council chores, but have undertaken to keep the council member informed of the sentiments of the employees represented by him in the employees' council.

*The Personnel Advisory Board.* The personnel advisory board consists of five members. One member is a city employee elected for a one-year term by the employees' council. The other four members are citizens who are appointed for four-year overlapping terms. Each of the three appointing authorities and the board of city commissioners selects one citizen member.

This board is authorized: (1) to receive, investigate and report to the appointing authority on any employee's complaint of discrimination and unfair treatment as to personnel matters; (2) upon request of any appointing authority to advise it concerning personnel problems and policies; (3) to consider and advise on any matter submitted to it by the personnel director; and (4) to establish rules of procedure in conformity with the merit system of personnel administration. In practice, the board has advised with the personnel supervisor from time to time on personnel problems presented to it for consideration; it has made recommendations pertaining to personnel policies and practices; and it has served as an appeal board for employees in disciplinary cases.

*Non-party Tradition in Wichita.* The organization and procedures described

above were not established as reforms directed against party spoilsmen. On the contrary, April, 1947 marks the thirtieth anniversary of the adoption of the city manager plan by this city. The city commissioners are elected on a non-partisan ballot in a city-wide election, and there is a strong non-party tradition for municipal elections in the community.

#### *Grievance Procedures*

As Professor Leonard D. White has pointed out, public interest requires both a guarantee of stability in the administrative corps, and the proper use of adequate disciplinary authority.<sup>2</sup> Employees who feel that their jobs are secure so long as they loyally and efficiently perform their duties are employees among whom there will be high morale. But if this security extends to those employees who don't "deliver," morale suffers. This means that supervisors must know that they have the authority to demand certain standards of performance, and that they are expected to do so. Yet nothing is more destructive of morale than a loss of confidence in the integrity or fairness of the administration. Consequently, it is essential that employees be made to feel that they may challenge administrative policies or the behavior of administrators which they believe to be unfair without, however, undermining the authority of the administrative staff. The position of the supervisor must remain clear in the minds of both the supervisor and the supervised. To achieve this balance presents a problem that is sometimes difficult to solve.

One of the factors in the solution to this problem is certainly an adequate grievance procedure. Our experience indicates that this means prompt attention to complaints, a grievance procedure that is as simple and direct as possible, and one that is available to all employees.

To be effective, it is also necessary to keep the adjustment of grievances as close as possible to the parties concerned. In this way there is a greater chance for a real

<sup>2</sup> See Leonard D. White, *Introduction to the Study of Public Administration*, Macmillan, New York, 1939, p. 398.



"meeting of minds" between the aggrieved employee and supervisor, and consequently a better chance for a genuine settlement of the difficulty.

There is one further component in an adequate grievance procedure that cannot be overlooked. That is provision for review of a case by an independent and disinterested body. Our experience indicates that the work of such a board will be light. But the assurance that an appeal to such a body can be made after other means of adjusting a grievance have failed is highly prized by employees. This is true, even though responsibility for the final disposition of the grievance remains with the appointing authority.

#### *The Grievance Machinery in Action*

THESE OBSERVATIONS are based on our experience in Wichita, and are, we believe, sound. The actual procedures described below reflect local conditions and practices, and hence may not be applicable, without revision, to other jurisdictions.

*The Departmental Committee.* Any employee who feels aggrieved because of any action affecting his status or conditions of employment is advised in the personnel manual to take his grievance to his immediate supervisor. It is the duty of this supervisor either to adjust the grievance or refer the matter to his own supervisor for attention.

If the employee is not satisfied with the action taken on his complaint, he may take it to his representative on the employees' council. This representative (or this representative working with his departmental committee, if he has such a committee) arranges to hear the aggrieved employee. The employee must state his complaint in writing. This clarifies the grievance in the employee's own mind, it insures all parties having a common understanding of the complaint, and it helps keep ensuing discussions centered on the points of conflict.

The deliberations of the conferees directed toward the solution of fairly well defined problems in personnel relations will normally result in sound conclusions. This is true because these conclusions will

have been reached only after the judgments of fellow workers, the views of interested administrators, and the counsel of an experienced representative from the personnel office have all been heard and weighed. Should these deliberations reach an impasse, the proper administrative official must make a decision in the matter. The solution agreed upon (or the decision of the proper administrative official, where a mutual acceptable solution cannot be worked out) must be presented in writing to the complainant employee, if so requested by him.

The advantages of this procedure are several. The employee sees that the proceeding is simple and direct; the administrator sees in it an attempt at reconciliation of conflicts rather than a challenge to his authority; the personnel office representative may participate more or less actively in the proceedings, according to need shown for his counsel; and the informality of the process makes for a real solution to the problems presented, rather than a mere formal routine.

*The Personnel Office.* So far we have largely ignored the role of the personnel office in dealing with grievances. This office, as is the case of personnel offices in comparatively small jurisdictions, is readily accessible to the employees. The office gives advice and counsel to many employees who come in to discuss their problems. Sometimes these problems involve job difficulties. In such cases, the personnel office attempts to work out a solution. Often informal help of this nature is all that is needed. But if the employee makes a definite complaint against his supervisor, the employee is advised to go to the supervisor with his complaint. This is important because failure to insist on this step means short-circuiting the supervisor, who is an essential link in our grievance procedure.

If the supervisor fails to work out a satisfactory adjustment and the employee so reports to the personnel office, the office will arrange a meeting between the aggrieved employee, his employees' council representative, and a member of the personnel office staff. At this meeting, the employee



puts his complaint in writing. Thereafter, the procedure is the same as described above.

*Procedure Still in Experimental Stage.* The grievance procedure described so far represents an evolving process rather than a finished product first conceived by someone, and then tried out. The procedure has slowly grown up in response to differing needs and demands that have presented themselves.

The system of conciliation conferences for dealing with complaints was the outgrowth of a similar plan tried out in the city's sanitation division, and a series of discussions of the problem by both the employees' council and the personnel advisory board. The department committees, which are an integral part of the system, originated independently of the plan for handling grievances. Being already functioning entities, they were brought into the grievance procedure in preference to creating a new employees' council grievance committee, as was suggested by the personnel advisory board. Only time will tell whether this decision was sound or not.

A similar system has been tried out for some time in the sanitation division with good success. The committee there has handled both employee complaints and citizen complaints against employees. Whether or not it will work equally well for all other units remains to be proved; the plan has not yet received a sufficient trial.

#### *Advisory Board Hears Appeals*

THE PERSONNEL ADVISORY BOARD, as its name indicates, has neither policy-making nor judicial powers. The board has consistently refused to transgress upon this limitation. Nevertheless, the board, when requested by an appointing authority or the personnel supervisor, has considered and advised on personnel problems and policies.

When the employees' council, through the personnel supervisor, requested the board to "establish an outline of procedure to be followed in all cases of appeal," the board complied. The board then went on to consider the entire problem of adequate grievance procedure, and advised the em-

ployees' council that, "the employees' council has a large responsibility in developing and administering such procedure."

The board is also an appeal board to which an employee can go when he feels that redress of his wrongs has been denied him. Since the decisions of the board, and the position taken by the board on personnel problems materially affect administrative practices, inquiry into the work of the board becomes an appropriate part of this discussion.

*Appeals to the Board.* An aggrieved employee who has followed the procedures outlined above, and who is not satisfied with the results, may file a request with the personnel supervisor for a hearing before the personnel advisory board. This request must be in writing, and must set forth the pertinent facts relating to the cause of the complaint. This step must be taken within ten days after the employee has been notified in writing of the decision on his original complaint. This decision is made by the employee's department or division head after the conference already described.

Since the board is authorized to hear appeals of employees "because of any action affecting his status or conditions of employment," its jurisdiction extends to complaints on unfair practices of supervisors, discriminatory promotions, and other matters, as well as disciplinary actions such as suspensions, demotions and removals. In its decision, the board may recommend: (1) the reinstatement of the employee, (2) confirmation of the suspension, demotion, or removal, (3) placing the employee on an eligible list for future employment in the same or another department, or (4) such other action as it deems appropriate. This last-mentioned power of recommendation opens up to the board a wide latitude of choice in its recommendations on cases submitted to it. Although the board can only file a written statement of its findings and conclusions with the appointing authority, and the decision of the appointing authority is final, no board decision has been reversed so far. The appointing authority's decision must be in writing, and a copy filed in the personnel office.

*Hearings Before the Board.* Upon receipt of a request for a hearing, the chairman of the board fixes a time and place for such hearing. The hearing must be held within ten days, except that it may be postponed from time to time for an additional ten days. However, in no case may the hearing be conducted more than thirty days after the request for such hearing has been received.

The complainant is given notice of the time and place set for the hearing by registered mail at least five days prior to the day of the hearing. He may present his own case, or avail himself of the help of his employees' council representative and departmental committee, or request the aid of an attorney, or any combination of these. The interested administrative officials may also avail themselves of the services of an attorney.

The first hearing on a complaint is at a closed meeting. If further hearings are required, the board then determines whether such hearings shall be closed or open to the public. All hearings are informal and conducted "with a view to the presentation of all material facts, so that a fair and impartial decision may be made." Neither side is heard except at a hearing at which both sides are given an opportunity to be heard.

*Attitude of Board Toward Appeals.* The board has, on the whole taken a dim view of its powers. In a case involving several members of the police division, the board declared, "This case is one in which the governing authorities laid down as a condition of continuing employment that the employees of the police division not engage in union activities, and that the dismissed employees refused to observe this condition. Here we do not have a case of an employee's grievance against his administrative superior, but rather a case of an employee challenging the authority of the governing body of the city to prohibit such activities. The question of the legal authority of the governing bodies to adopt this policy cannot be decided by the board."

The board has been willing to advise the

appointing authorities on questions of policy when requested to do so, but has refused to give such advice in decisions on cases coming before it. Then the board has reached its conclusions within the framework of policies existing at the time the case arose. With respect to cases more clearly within its jurisdiction, the board has advised employees that in cases of discharge, public employees may be discharged for the same reasons that would be considered good cause in any fair-minded, well-run business organization. Examples given by the board include improper habits, insubordination, absence from duty without adequate cause, inability to do satisfactory work, and conduct unbecoming a city employee.

The board has also insisted that the burden of proof is on the appealing employee to show that the action complained of by him constitutes discrimination and unfair treatment. The board has emphasized that when a case is appealed to it, the question under consideration is whether the appealing employee's conduct deserved the action taken against him, not whether his superior is a good executive. In general, the board has refused to assume responsibility for employment policies adopted by the appointing authorities. It has encouraged the settling of personnel difficulties within the administrative structure, and has taken a lenient view toward minor infractions of rules by employees.

### Conclusions

THE GRIEVANCE PROCEDURES here described were evolved to meet our local needs. Some of these procedures have not been tested over a long enough period to establish their soundness, although our experience with them to date makes us optimistic of the results.

Grievance procedures, at best, are but poor substitutes for constructive leadership. It should be said that grievance procedures are evidence of recognition of the fact that our techniques of leadership are not yet up to the tasks that leadership is called on to perform.

# Wage Negotiations in the Tennessee Valley Authority . HARRY L. CASE

THE ACT OF CONGRESS establishing the Tennessee Valley Authority provides that the board of directors have broad discretion in the selection, promotion, retention, and compensation of the personnel required to carry out the provisions of the Act. Specifically, the Act prescribes that "The board shall without regard to the provisions of civil service laws applicable to officers and employees of the United States, appoint such managers, assistant managers, officers, employees, attorneys, and agents, as are necessary for the transaction of its business, fix their compensation, define their duties, require bonds of such of them as the board may designate, and provide a system of organization to fix responsibility and promote efficiency. Any appointee of the board may be removed in the discretion of the board. No regular officer or employee of the Corporation shall receive a salary in excess of that received by the members of the board."

Thus, other than the fact that employees need not be compensated under federal civil service laws, and that no employee may receive a larger salary than a member of the board, which is fixed at \$10,000, the TVA Act grants complete discretion to the board of directors in the compensation of salaried personnel, on the grounds that TVA operations were sufficiently different from other governmental operations to require great flexibility in determining pay policies, as in determining other personnel policies. With respect to "laborers and mechanics," however, the Act goes on to prescribe that they shall be compensated on the basis of rates of pay prevailing in the vicinity for similar work, and that "in the determination of such prevailing rate or rates, due regard shall be given to those

rates which have been secured through collective agreement by representatives of employers and employees."

The Act goes on to prescribe that disputes as to what are the prevailing rates shall be referred to the Secretary of Labor for determination. Thus the Act clearly contemplated that in the area of wage determination for laborers and mechanics, at least, the representatives of employees and of TVA management should somehow jointly participate in the determination of wages, and that disputes might arise which would need to be settled by a third party. This function was assigned to the Secretary of Labor, not in the sense of determining what wages should be on TVA projects, but in sense of serving as arbitrator in the settlement of actual disputes. Congress had before it at the time the precedents of unilateral wage board determinations for Army and Navy construction, and of pre-determinations of prevailing wages by the Department of Labor. But the principle written into the TVA Act was different in the sense that it provided a basis for a definitely bilateral understanding between TVA management and its employees.

## *The TVA Employee Relationship Policy*

THIS EMPHASIS by Congress stimulated the TVA board to adopt a policy of full-fledged negotiations with representatives of its employees on wage matters, which became a part of the broad policy of encouraging employee organization and collective dealing. This over-all policy of employee-management relations was formally adopted by the Board in 1935, after extensive discussion with employee representatives, in the Employee Relationship Policy. The policy declares that,

For the purposes of collective bargaining and employee-management cooperation, employees of

• HARRY L. CASE is Director of Personnel of the Tennessee Valley Authority.

the Authority shall have the right to organize and designate representatives of their own choosing. In the exercise of this right they shall be free from any and all restraint, interference, or coercion on the part of the management and supervisory staff. This paragraph shall not be construed to limit the rights of employees to organize for other lawful purposes.

The majority of the employees as a whole, or of any professional group, craft, or other appropriate unit, shall have the right to determine the organization, person or persons who shall represent the employees as a whole, or any such professional group, craft, or unit. . . .

In the early days of the organization, TVA construction was naturally a dominant influence on the pattern of employee relationships. Practically all TVA construction has been done by force account. The patterns of employee organization were well fixed in the construction industry, and from practically the beginning of TVA construction activities, the American Federation of Labor craft unions represented the interests of TVA construction employees in wage and other personnel matters. For about the first three years these dealings were with the fifteen individual craft unions.<sup>1</sup> However, it soon became apparent that it was to the interest of both parties that these negotiations be coordinated in some way, and in early 1937 these unions united to form the Tennessee Valley Trades and Labor Council, and

elected a president, vice-president and secretary. In the fall of 1937, this Council met with TVA for the first time in the Third Annual Wage Conference. Annual wage conferences have been continued since, the Twelfth Conference, determining rates for the calendar year 1947, having been held in December 1946.

In 1940, relationships between the Council and TVA were formalized by the adoption of the General Agreement between the Tennessee Valley Authority and the Tennessee Valley Trades and Labor Council. At this time the International Association of Bridge, Structural and Ornamental Iron Workers decided not to become a party to this agreement and withdrew from the Council. This introduced complications to negotiations but did not affect overall relationships with the Council. Separate annual negotiations are held with this union. This General Agreement put into writing, along with many other important provisions of labor-management relations outside the scope of this article, the specific procedures which had evolved in the planning and execution of the annual wage conferences. In brief, these procedures are described as follows.

#### *The Preliminary Conference*

EITHER PARTY may notify the other, between September 1 and September 15, that a preliminary conference is desired in October. The need for a wage conference is determined at the preliminary conference and the scheduling of a wage conference for late November or early December is decided upon. Experience has demonstrated that more time is needed than this schedule allowed, and these dates have been advanced by mutual consent to allow the time required for adequate preparation. This preliminary conference also considers any problems which must be handled before the wage conference convenes, such as determining the framework of negotiations during the period of national wage stabilization, during the war. It should be noted that wage conferences have been held every year since 1936 at this time, except that the Tenth Annual Wage Confer-

<sup>1</sup> These unions were the following:

Brotherhood of Painters, Decorators and Paperhangers of America.

International Brotherhood of Boiler Makers, Iron Ship Builders and Helpers of America.

International Brotherhood of Blacksmiths, Drop Forgers and Helpers.

International Association of Machinists.

International Brotherhood of Electrical Workers.

International Hod Carriers', Building and Common Laborers' Union of America.

International Union of Operating Engineers.

Sheet Metal Workers' International Association.

International Union of Wood, Wire and Metal Lathers.

International Association of Bridge Structural and Ornamental Ironworkers.

Operative Plasterers' and Cement Finishers' International Association.

United Association of Plumbers and Steam Fitters of the United States and Canada.

United Brotherhood of Carpenters and Joiners of America.

Bricklayers, Masons and Plasterers International Union of America.

International Brotherhood of Teamsters, Chauffeurs, Stablemen and Helpers of America.



ence was postponed by agreement until the spring of 1945, instead of being held in the fall of 1944, due to pronounced uncertainties in the national wage picture. At no time has the Council requested a conference prior to the normally scheduled dates, even when inflationary pressures have been very strong.

After agreement that a wage conference shall be held, TVA conducts, under the direction of the Personnel Department, a survey of prevailing wages and other compensation data in the vicinity. Major industries, contractors' associations, utilities, and other employers are contacted by field investigators who obtain data on the spot as to what wages are being paid for work corresponding to that in TVA positions. In this process the surveyors also contact the local union representatives in order not to overlook union data and pending negotiations or current trends.

TVA and the Council were early presented with the problem of defining "vicinity" as used in the TVA Act. It was clearly to the interest of TVA to have a single rate of pay for each type of work throughout TVA's operations. The unions, in general, were also interested in uniform rates. Hence the determination of prevailing rates in the vicinity has come to mean the determination of a single TVA rate for each classification of work, regardless of where the work is carried on. Because considerable numbers of employees are recruited from the larger southern cities on the periphery of the Tennessee Valley (Memphis, Birmingham, Atlanta, Louisville and Asheville), rates in these cities are also taken into account along with rates in the Tennessee Valley proper.

#### *Conducting the Wage Conference*

THE OPENING SESSION of the annual wage conference is a significant session, attended by approximately 30 management representatives and 100 union representatives, including the international representatives of each union, and business agents and employee representatives of locals in the Tennessee Valley. The Director of Personnel of TVA and the President of

the Tennessee Valley Trades and Labor Council serve as "co-chairmen" throughout the wage conference, so that the responsibility for procedures is divided between labor and management representatives. The Chief of the Personnel Relations Division of the Personnel Department and the secretary of the Tennessee Valley Trades and Labor Council serve as co-secretaries.

At the opening session the unions through the Council present a General Brief which analyzes the general setting in which the requests are made, makes general proposals for dealing with compensation problems and formally presents the wage requests, which have previously been submitted to the Personnel Department for tabulation. The requests and the supporting data, in the form of contracts, evidence of wage board decisions, etc., are thereupon referred to the joint Wage Data Committee, made up of an equal number of management and labor members designated by TVA and the Council respectively. The wage data assembled and tabulated by TVA likewise are referred to this Committee. The function of the Wage Data Committee is to determine the "factuality" of the data presented by the Council and that presented by TVA.

The Wage Data Committee, usually meeting continuously for three or four days, hears supporting statements from union representatives, investigates discrepancies in data, and reports back to the Wage Conference its findings. It should be emphasized that this committee is a joint committee of management and labor members, so that its agreement upon a report represents a meeting of minds as to what facts shall be before the Wage Conference in the actual wage negotiations.

TVA management hereupon, under the chairmanship of the Director of Personnel, develops a proposed wage schedule which represents TVA's judgment of what the prevailing wage picture supports, and this schedule is presented to the Council at the second general session of the conference, usually held about two weeks after the first session. At this time the TVA also presents



a reply to the General Brief, which deals with the general questions discussed by the Council in its Brief and provides a general explanation of the guiding considerations which have influenced TVA in its judgments of the wage situation.

The negotiations from this point are in the area of interpretation of the factual prevailing wage data. There is, of course, considerable variation in the rates being paid for a given class of work in various parts of the Tennessee Valley. Agreement as to what shall be the wage rate for TVA is not a scientific determination because of the many variables, but an agreement is hammered out in the negotiations, where the TVA is interested in tipping the balance in favor of low costs, and the Council in tipping it in favor of higher wage levels. Concessions in interpretations are made on both sides until, as a rule, agreement is reached on the entire wage schedule. The final negotiations usually take three long and rather arduous days of intermittent joint and separate sessions. The International Representative of the individual unions, assisted by representative employees, carries the argument for the employees, but the integrated activity of the Council is influential in the planning of the unions' approach, and particularly in the final stages of the negotiations. The decisions finally reached are subject to formal approval by the TVA Board of Directors, and become effective at the beginning of the calendar year.

It is perhaps significant of the degree of agreement that has been reached in TVA wage negotiations that in only two instances has a member of the Council resorted to the appeals machinery to the Secretary of Labor. In one of these the Secretary found in favor of the TVA; in one in favor of the union.

Although the previous discussion has perhaps conveyed the impression that wage negotiations are limited to construction rates, such is not the case. All maintenance work in power and chemical operations, reservoir property maintenance, building and transportation maintenance, is performed by craftsmen on annual rates of

pay who come within the category of "laborers and mechanics" for the purpose of wage determination. In addition, all employees engaged in the operation of hydroelectric and steam power plants, and in the operation of the chemical plants are annually rated "trades and labor" employees as this class of work is described in TVA. Altogether at the present time (May, 1947) there are 3500 maintenance and operating trades and labor employees whose wages are determined by collective negotiation in the manner described in preceding pages.

### *The Role of Job-Classification*

IT IS PERHAPS self-evident that wage negotiations for a complex organization such as TVA must be based on a well-defined system of job identification or classification. In the field of construction, and in most of the maintenance work, it has been mutually agreed and set forth in the General Agreement that established craft standards shall govern, and that the content of work of such classifications shall be determined on the basis of craft practice, jurisdictional agreements and awards and other methods customarily accepted by labor unions. The Trades and Labor Council assists in defining problems and securing acceptable answers to jurisdictional disputes.

In the operating positions, however, and in some types of maintenance work, there are no such well established union standards. In these areas job content must necessarily be largely, though not exclusively, a management determination. But also in these areas questions of relative difficulty and responsibility of the work are determining considerations, along with prevailing rates of pay, in setting wage rates.

To deal with questions of job content TVA and the Council have established a Joint Classification Committee, made up of equal numbers of TVA management and Council representatives, which jointly resolves classification questions for trades and labor positions. This Committee has recently developed classification schedules for all positions in power operations and chemical operations, establishing the classification levels and allocating all positions

to appropriate grades. Wage negotiations for these positions are therefore within the framework of the classification plan, emphasizing internal consistency of rates as well as prevailing wage conditions in the area. Adoption of these classification schedules has also simplified the process of collecting wage data for operating classes, since data are collected only on a limited number of classes in each grade which TVA and the Council agree are representative of their respective grades.

In the early days of wage negotiations in TVA these classification questions, along with many other questions of apprenticeship, employment policy, grievances, etc., were taken up as a part of the general wage conference. Establishment of continuing joint machinery such as the Joint Classification Committee, the Central Joint Apprenticeship Council, and the Central Joint Co-operative Committee, have however taken a considerable burden from the wage conference proper and have provided more adequate machinery for dealing with the many complex questions of personnel policy on a more deliberate basis than was possible in the wage conference. These joint committees have, of course, great values of their own, but it is not appropriate to go into that subject here.

The wage conference does, however, include negotiations on other compensation questions than the basic rate of pay, such as overtime rates, leave, holiday provision, shift differential, reporting time, and other compensation matters. Provisions on these matters are incorporated into supplementary schedules of the General Agreement, and are subject to renegotiation at wage conferences. Except for the fact that annually rated employees under applicable laws and regulations receive the benefits of federal annual and sick leave provisions, prevailing practices are followed in these matters as in questions of rate of pay, but the emphasis is on uniform policies for all crafts in these matters.

A FEW OBSERVATIONS about the prevailing rate principle may be in order at this point. This principle has been criticized at times

as applied to TVA as not being consistent with the concept of the federal government as a progressive employer, since prevailing rates in the southern area of which the Tennessee Valley is a part have been generally below rates in most other parts of the country. TVA's position has been that this provision of the TVA Act is wise because it is essential that TVA compensation be tied in with the economy of the region, since it is in competition for trades and labor employees with private industries in the area. Actually there is little doubt that TVA wage policies have been influential in the gradual raising of wage levels that has occurred in the Tennessee Valley since 1933, primarily because of the provision in the TVA Act that consideration should be given to rates arrived at through collective bargaining and because of the adoption of a valley-wide wage schedule. Since TVA rates in turn have a reciprocal effect on other rates in the Tennessee Valley area, the overall effect has undoubtedly been progressive. Although the Council and TVA have jointly studied the question through a Joint Wage Study Committee, no better formula has been thought of which both parties have wanted to recommend to Congress.

TVA policies and practices relating to the compensation of salaried or "white-collar" employees are beyond the scope of this article. However, it may be mentioned that the gradual extension of employee organization in these types of employment has resulted in a relationship between management and salaried employees comparable to that existing in the trades and labor field. TVA policy is to establish compensation of salaried employees at levels generally comparable to those prevailing in the federal service. Negotiations with salaried employees are conducted within this framework and policy.

#### *Experience with Negotiation Machinery*

IT IS SIGNIFICANT that under the machinery worked out between TVA and the Tennessee Valley Trades and Labor Council, no wage controversy has ever interfered with progress of the TVA job. Even during the

war, when inflationary pressures were considerable and wage controls limited the scope of collective bargaining, the machinery of the annual wage conference held firm.

The significance of the wage conferences extends beyond the mere determination of mutually satisfactory wages, important as that is. Actually the annual wage conferences have been the cornerstone of a complex set of relationships which has developed between the Council and TVA. Joint machinery for classification and training have been mentioned. Crowning the whole program of joint relationships is the joint cooperative committee program, under which representatives of employees and management sit down together to work out improved job efficiency, job conditions, safety, and similar factors of mutual interest but outside the realm of collective bargaining as it has traditionally been defined. This development was contemplated in the Employee Relationship Policy in 1935, and is therein expressed in the following language:

As a further development of this Policy the Board of Directors looks forward to the establishment of joint conferences between the duly authorized representatives of the supervised employees and the supervisory and management staff for the purpose of systematic employee-management cooperation. The Board recognizes that responsible organizations and associations of employees are helpful to such cooperation. It is suggested that such joint cooperative conferences might well devote themselves to furthering the objectives for which the Tennessee Valley Authority was created. In so doing, these conferences might consider such matters as the elimination of waste in construction and production; the conservation of materials, supplies, and energy; the improvement in quality of workmanship and services; the promotion of education and training; the correction of conditions making for grievances and misunderstandings; the encouragement of courtesy in the relations of employees with the public; the safeguarding of health; the prevention of hazards to life and property; the betterment of employment conditions; and the strengthening of the morale of the service.

TVA and the Council are well on the way to full realization of the broad objectives of this statement. In scope and importance it goes far beyond wage negotiations. But without the solid foundation of successful collective bargaining relationships, this broader program would never have been possible.

# The Illinois State In-Service Training Program . . . . . ROBERT L. HUNTER

---

**M**ORE THAN 5,000 employees of the state of Illinois, representing practically every elective office, code department, board, and commission, have participated in the state's in-service training program during the last three years. How did this training originate, and what has it accomplished?

In 1943 the Illinois Civil Service Commission, unable to secure qualified personnel technicians after a nation-wide examination, established a trainee classification of Personnel Assistant, for the employment of college graduates without public personnel experience who could develop through training and experience into qualified technicians. A training program for these Personnel Assistants was set up. Members of the Commission staff and other qualified state employees acted as instructors. As part of this training program, the Commission secured the cooperation of the University of Illinois in offering graduate work in public administration through its extension division at Springfield, the state capitol. The first class, conducted by Dr. H. K. Allen, Director of the Bureau of Economic and Business Research of the University of Illinois, attracted a number of state employees from other agencies besides the Civil Service Commission.

Dr. Allen, in addition to his teaching and research work at the University, possessed experience as a public employee on the local, state, and federal levels, and at the time of this class was on leave of absence from the University while he served as district price officer for the OPA in Springfield. His background of experience added prestige to the course. Soon directors of various state agencies, all of whom were experiencing personnel difficulties, asked

the Civil Service Commission to establish training for their employees. Thus the state's in-service training program came into being.

As the first step in launching a statewide training program, the Commission arranged a series of seven weekly lectures and training films of wide interest and applicability. Films included "Basic Typing Machine Operations," "Take a Letter Please" (what *not* to do in dictating), "Advance Typing Shortcuts," and "Maintenance of Office Machines." Lecture subjects were: "Writing Letters to the Public," "Public Relations," "How to Speak More Effectively," "Publicity Channels," and "Effective Use of Radio." Attendance at these two-hour sessions ranged from 30 to 500.

## *Offer University Extension Classes*

AS A RESULT of this interest in training and a realization of the value of in-service training for state employees, the first state-wide class in state accounting methods was started early in 1944, to familiarize those employees responsible for formulating or administering departmental budgets with newly adopted forms and procedures. Though this class was conducted in Springfield by the extension division of the university for undergraduate credit, only five of the 49 enrollees registered for university credit, the majority of them taking the class to help them in their daily work. Enrollees in this class represented 19 different state agencies.

Early in the development of the Illinois training program, it became apparent that university extension classes alone would not meet the training needs of the state service. In the first place, many state employees have acquired much of their knowledge through experience rather than through formal education, and do not meet the requirements necessary for taking ad-

---

• ROBERT L. HUNTER is President of the Illinois State Civil Service Commission.

vanced undergraduate or graduate work for credit. Secondly, these employees, because of their practical knowledge, are impatient with classes which deal principally with theory. Many courses, acceptable on a university campus, fail completely when used with employed adults, unless their content is carefully evaluated and applied to the work situation. Finally, university extension classes require set fees which are frequently higher than state employees are willing to pay, particularly if they are not interested in acquiring university credit.

Accordingly, the Civil Service Commission decided to offer, in addition to the university extension classes, non-credit short courses, streamlined to the work situation and broken into shorter units. Experience showed that employees will enroll much more readily in two eight-weeks courses than in one course lasting sixteen weeks.

In addition to their flexibility, short courses have another advantage, namely, that of fee. The first short courses were offered on a tuition-free basis. Under this stimulus, a class in letter writing was scheduled. As a university extension course with a \$10.00 fee and 16 weekly meetings, this course had attracted an enrollment of 22; on a tuition-free basis, and a ten weeks' duration, enrollment rose to 101.

It soon became apparent that many state employees, like other people, value services or commodities according to their cost. Classes for which they paid no tuition became only a pleasant diversion. Irregular attendance kills interest. The mortality for the letter writing class was unusually high, and some of those who did not actually quit the class attended so spasmodically that they gained little. After a careful analysis of the situation, the Commission decided that a smaller, more interested group was preferable to a large, loosely-knit class. Accordingly, a \$2 tuition was established for non-credit short courses. This small tuition, while it defrays only a fraction of the cost of instruction and materials, has encouraged regular attendance and has raised class morale generally.

A training program on a statewide basis faces many problems not met in a training

plan for a local governmental agency. Among these are the dispersion of employees over a wide area, the difficulty of conducting classes, securing suitable classrooms and instructors, the question of establishing classes for small groups, and other similar considerations. During the first year of the program, classes were confined to Springfield. However, a consistent demand for similar classes in Chicago induced the Commission to offer a series of short courses on filing there in 1945. These classes, which consisted of five two-hour meetings on consecutive days, attracted an enrollment of 211. Because of inadequate budget and other training facilities, a regularly established program for the Chicago area was not scheduled until 1946, when short courses in "State Dictation Review," "Basic Accounting," and "Effective Letter Writing" were given. Requests for additional classes in a number of other fields have been made, and it is anticipated that the Chicago training program will be expanded as rapidly as the Commission's budget and facilities warrant.

#### *Training State Hospital Supervisors*

ONE OF THE most serious personnel shortages experienced during the war was in the welfare institutions. Salaries paid employees in state hospitals have been so low in comparison to those paid similar employees in industry and in Veterans' Administration hospitals that the state has had a serious problem to maintain reasonable standards of care and treatment for its wards. To help develop supervisory abilities more quickly in new employees and to raise the morale of these hospital staffs, the Civil Service Commission in 1945 adapted the principles of the War Manpower Commission's "Job Relations Training" to state hospital situations.

This training, known as "Human Relations," has been given at eleven state hospitals and one school. It has been given to hospital superintendents, departmental supervisors, and other staff members, totaling 3811. Participating in this training have been physicians, psychologists, nurses, occupational therapists, dietitians, mainte-



nance men, and attendants. Basic to the success of this training has been the support it has received from the Director of the Department of Public Welfare and from hospital superintendents and their department heads. These officials not only helped select local staff members to carry on the training after the civil service training specialists left, but their active participation also helped to convince employees that the training had the active support of top management.

The "Human Relations" training is not a lecture class. It is a series of five two-hour conferences, during which employees with supervisory responsibility are taught a few basic principles for preventing or solving personnel problems, and are given practice in applying those principles to work situations. Conference groups are ordinarily limited to ten or twelve persons, so that each participant has an opportunity to present a problem and to lead the class through the steps necessary to arrive at an intelligent solution. Although at first hospital superintendents were skeptical of the results from so simple a problem-solving pattern, upon actual experience with the training their attitude changed to one of acceptance.

In addition to drilling supervisors in such well-known but frequently overlooked procedures as getting the facts, weighing and deciding, taking action, and checking the results, this training plan brings supervisory employees into informal situations which help them realize their responsibility both to supervisors and to subordinates. One superintendent reported, for example, that this training had reduced "buck-passing" to a minimum—that more problems were settled on the lower levels, and only the toughest now reached his desk. Another pointed out the increase in teamwork. In the course of problem discussions, the hospital's various employees—dietary, medical, nursing, recreational, maintenance, who were previously pulling against each other like a dozen or more opposing teams—suddenly discovered that all faced similar problems and all were seeking the same goal. Thus the "Human Relations"

conference training has served a purpose among state employees similar to that of the conference table in labor-management disputes.

### *Veteran On-The-Job Training*

UNIVERSITY EXTENSION CLASSES for undergraduate and graduate credit, non-credit short courses, and "Human Relations" training for supervisors—all were well established when the state turned its attention to on-the-job training for World War II veteran employees. One of the first on-the-job training programs established by a state agency utilized several of these training classes, particularly those in "State Dictation Review," "Basic Accounting," and "Effective Letter Writing" for part of its related training.

Because of its experience with employee training, the Commission was selected to set up and administer on-the-job training for all state-employed veterans, in cooperation with the State Superintendent of Public Instruction and the Illinois Veterans' Commission. The Civil Service Commission helps various state agencies draft training programs, coordinates similar programs of the numerous state agencies, and makes training facilities available through colleges, high schools, and business schools.

On-the-job training for veterans received a setback when the G.I. Bill was amended in 1946 to place the present low ceilings on salary plus subsistence. Since that time it has been possible to establish programs only for classifications in the lower salary ranges. A number of programs have recently been approved and are now in operation, particularly in the Department of Public Welfare. It is believed that veteran on-the-job training will enable the state to compete with industry and federal agencies in attracting high caliber young men and women whose training was interrupted by military service.

Veterans' preference in examinations under the Illinois state civil service law practically guarantees veterans the positions for which they are training if the training programs are carefully drawn up and the veterans utilize their training op-

portunities. Persons entitled to veterans' preference get absolute preference in open competitive examinations and point preference in promotional examinations. Three additional factors will also operate to the advantage of veteran trainees: (1) all original appointees since July 22, 1943, must stand re-examination for permanent eligibility; (2) a large number of provisional appointments will provide promotional opportunities; and (3) under the new Illinois State Employees' Retirement Act, a large number of older employees are leaving state service. The combined effect of these factors give state-employed World War II veteran trainees ample promotional opportunities.

### *Recognition for Employees' Efforts*

EVERYONE LIKES RECOGNITION. Every worthwhile training program needs recognition and prestige if it is to have wide appeal. Accordingly, at the end of the first year of training a banquet was held, at which all state employees who had satisfactorily completed their training were honored. Speakers included representatives of the University of Illinois, class instructors, and directors of state agencies whose employees were being honored.

After the first year, the number of trainees grew too large for a dinner. The Commission designed a training certificate which bears the signature of the Governor of Illinois, the President of the Civil Service Commission, and the class instructor. Believing that not only the trainee but also his employer should be notified of his satisfactory completion of the training course, the Commission sends two copies of this information to each student's employing agency—one copy for the central personnel files, and the other for the employee's immediate supervisor. Complete training records are also maintained in the civil service commission's offices, for evaluation in promotional examinations, and for consideration in other personnel transactions.

Because official duties frequently conflict with class meetings, attendance alone is not a sufficient criterion for determining which trainees have satisfactorily completed a

class. Though final determination is left to the class instructor, the following criteria are recommended for his consideration in deciding which class members shall receive certificates: (1) attendance, (2) preparation of assignments, (3) class participation, and (4) results of tests and examinations.

### *Results of Program*

AFTER THREE YEARS of work with the Illinois training program, it is interesting to compare the original purposes with the actual results. University extension classes and non-credit short courses were established to assist employing agencies by making their employees more efficient on present jobs, or by preparing these employees for more responsible jobs where their services were needed. It was instituted as a wartime measure. It was also anticipated that this training would benefit employees by enabling them to perform their present duties more satisfactorily and thus earning security and approval, and by preparing them for advancement.

In setting up training programs, questionnaires are first distributed to former trainees and other employees who are training-minded, inviting suggestions and comments on proposed courses. After a training term is completed, questionnaires are sent both to the enrollees and to their supervisors, inviting suggestions for increasing the usefulness of the course, and recommendations for additional classes. Most of the questionnaires returned contain only conventional answers, but a few make worthwhile suggestions. The most helpful comments, however, come orally in informal discussions with class members. The training questionnaires from the class members have shown one important fallacy—that a considerable number of employees enter training believing it will automatically guarantee promotion.

The active cooperation of top management is necessary for a successful training program. Unless employees understand that top management stands behind it, not only by encouraging employees to attend classes, but also by considering training accomplishments in making personnel trans-

actions, a training program operates under a handicap. Employees must also understand that training alone is not enough; such factors as cooperativeness, personality, special skills, physical condition, and even seniority must frequently be considered in making promotions.

As has already been intimated under the section on "Human Relations" training, the supervisory conferences conducted at the state hospitals have produced unexpected though highly valuable results. A number of hospital superintendents have found that their personnel problems have appreciably decreased. Mention has already been made of the increase in teamwork and reduction in buck-passing. There are also those peculiar individuals who, until this course was brought to them, had never seen themselves "as others see them." One hospital superintendent declared at the outset of the training program that he would consider the entire program worthwhile if it reformed one well-intentioned but highly troublesome employee. The problem situation provided the necessary setting; this employee for the first time saw himself and his idiosyncracies from the supervisor's stand-point; and the miracle was accomplished.

Results of the Illinois training program are perhaps best evaluated by its increasing popularity with employees, many of whom attend classes entirely on their own time, and most of whom are not reimbursed for their tuition. Starting with an enrollment of 15 in 1943, the number increased the next year to 222, and in 1945 grew to 1232, with the inauguration of "Human Relations" training at three welfare institutions. During 1946, enrollment in classes dropped to 362, due partly to the \$2.00 tuition for non-credit short courses, but the "Human Relations" training program brought participation to a high of 2498, with four civil service trainers assigned practically full-time to training conferences at nine state hospitals. During this year, too, the Commission started the practice of developing local trainers at the various institutions to carry on the training after the civil service program is completed.

### Conclusion

A DISCUSSION of the Illinois training program would not be complete without acknowledging the splendid assistance of a number of cooperating agencies. First among these is the University of Illinois, which through its Division of University Extension and other departments has made available outstanding instructors for Springfield classes. Financing of numerous non-credit short courses has been made possible by the State Superintendent of Public Instruction, the Illinois Veterans' Commission, and the Department of Public Health. Classroom facilities and instructional staff have been contributed by the Illinois Public Aid Commission.

In the previous discussion, several advantages of the non-credit short course over the university extension class were pointed out. These include flexibility in content, lower tuition, and shorter unit. The conventional university class is set up on a sixteen-week basis. Adults with heavy work assignments and home responsibilities frequently are unwilling to commit themselves for sixteen weeks, but will enroll for two eight-week or ten-week courses.

University extension classes perform an important function in technical, professional, and scientific fields, particularly where the employees wish to acquire undergraduate or graduate credit. They have been highly effective for librarians, social workers, personnel technicians, and advanced accountants. For developing sub-professional or semi-professional skills and knowledges, however, particularly where the employees are not interested in college credit, short courses are invaluable. Non-credit classes are particularly well adapted to such fields as dictation review, filing, basic and intermediate accounting, effective letter writing, and elementary statistics. In all of these short courses the emphasis has been placed on including only the most essential theory, and stressing intensive application to actual work situations. The third type of training, "Human Relations," has proved more effective when administered on a departmental or institutional basis (with adaption to the

personnel problems of that particular agency) than when given on a state-wide basis.

Not only the content of a course for adult employees, but also the course leader is tremendously important. High school and college students may accept opinion unquestioningly, but not experienced adult workers! They insist that a direct and obvious relationship be established between each part of a training course and their work situations. Because of their knowledge of state work situations and duties,

some of the most successful instructors in the Illinois state program are state employees who have achieved unusual success in their jobs and who possess the necessary training and ability to present their ideas effectively.

While the Illinois training program is still in its infancy, one thing has been achieved: awareness among state employees and administrators of the benefits which can result from an in-service training program carefully planned and effectively administered.

---

# The Public-Relations Value of the Annual Report . . . OSCAR RICHARD

**M**OST public personnel agencies limit their public relations activities to the prescriptions set forth in the acts establishing them—advertisements and announcements of examinations, and the annual or biennial report. Although a few progressive civil service commissions have begun to utilize novel methods of recruiting publicity, the typical annual report continues to be a conglomeration of uninterpreted statistics, and has little or no appeal for the ordinary citizen. Generally speaking, the mine-run report attempts to ram a hodge-podge of technical data down the throat of an unwilling public. Its public relations possibilities have been almost totally overlooked.

Many agencies fail to realize the educational and public relations potentialities of their most important informational medium, and merely issue the report because the law requires them to do so. Usually the annual report is the beginning and the end of the public reporting efforts of a personnel agency, and for this reason its importance as an instrument for enlisting worthwhile support cannot be overstressed. The high-interest general public is the source of worthwhile support, and this group, which includes legislators, elective officials, the press, civic organizations, colleges and universities, personnel officers, department heads, and county officials, should at least be generally informed of the problems of an agency, and at the same time sufficiently acquainted with its accomplishments to give support to its program.

The report can also be of value to other public personnel agencies. There is a great need for the exchange of information, ideas, new developments, and techniques.

No agency can afford to experiment in all the phases of its work. Experiences must be pooled, and detailed accounts of activities furnish an excellent means of acquainting other personnel agencies with such developments. To be of real value in this respect, however, there is a necessity for greater standardization of annual reports.

Probably the first effort to establish uniformity in public reporting of public personnel agencies was made in 1919 by the National Civil Service Reform League, which issued a 24-page pamphlet entitled *Standardization of Civil Service Reports*. Several attempts at uniformity have been made since then, but apparently no generally accepted set of standards for the form and content of annual reports has yet been formulated. What has been done so far is limited to collections of doctrines, expressing what, in the authority's opinion, the public ought to know, rather than what the public is willing and capable of understanding. There is an almost complete lack of agreement among those who have taken the trouble to make suggestions in regard to the annual report.

In its report, the Assembly's Committee on Public Relations of Public Personnel Agencies<sup>1</sup> canvassed fifteen experts on the contents of annual reports and got the following results: 440 separate items were suggested by at least one of the experts; two or more agreed on 156 of them, three or more on 106, four or more on 52, and five or more on only 26. The wide variety of items and the concentration on so few clearly indicates that personnel men are far from being in agreement as to what constitutes an adequate over-all story of their operations. This is only natural. There are differences in the sizes and scope of operations in various public personnel agencies.

\* OSCAR RICHARD is Editorial Assistant on the staff of the Louisiana Department of State Civil Service.

<sup>1</sup> *Public Relations of Public Personnel Agencies*. Civil Service Assembly, Chicago, 1941.



What may constitute a complete account of the activities of one agency may furnish material for only a fragmentary sketch of the accomplishments of another. Data available in one system may not be available to another, and information very important to one agency may not be sufficiently important to report by another. The individual agency must decide what items are to be included and what style to use, keeping in mind (1) the purpose of the report, (2) the types of publics for which it is intended, and (3) the amount of money available for publication.

### *Purpose of the Report*

THE PURPOSE of the annual report, of course, is to tell a complete story of one year of the agency's operations. Although the story is about activities during the past year, recommendations and plans for the future are also appropriate. The story should be coherently woven together in a readable style. Each part should add something of significance and should be related to every other part and to the whole.

The annual report should be aimed primarily at the high-interest publics. It should not be written "up" to the administrator level, nor "down" to the man in the street. The high-interest publics must be sold on the advantages of and the necessity for supporting a merit system, and they in turn can do a better selling job to the general public than the agency itself.

The format and general appearance of the annual report, will of course depend on the agency's budget. Some of the larger agencies can afford to produce handsomely bound typographical gems; others can only afford to put out a small mimeographed pamphlet. However, as reported in the *Manual on the Use of State Publications* issued by the Committee on Public Documents of the American Library Association, "there is too much of a tendency . . . to regard expenditures for reporting as unnecessary, as a sort of a luxury to be frowned upon in the interests of economy." The manual also points out that "there is a definite correlation between the efficiency of a department and the quality and the

adequacy of its reporting. Making allowance for the fact that it is possible for a department that accomplishes little to make itself look well on paper, a long and intimate acquaintance with state governments will convince anyone that such is rarely the case. A weak department either will not report at all, or it will issue a report quite in accord with the inadequate character of its other work."

### *The Editor's Job*

TOO MANY AGENCIES delegate the job of preparing an annual report to any Tom, Dick, or Harry available to take on extra work. The rough copy for the report naturally comes from department and division heads, but the revising, editing, and standardizing of the raw material must be done by one person, preferably in the administrative division, who is selected specifically for the task. Training in public relations, editing, and writing, and a working knowledge of typography is desirable.

Regardless of the publication process used, the editor's job remains practically the same. Preparation of the annual report is a long task of gathering, compiling, and standardizing. He must study records and periodic reports of each division in the department throughout the period to be covered, making sure that these documents will yield the necessary data for the annual report. He must be on the alert for special projects which can best be presented in a feature style, rather than as statistical presentations. A discussion with each division head at the close of the reporting period will give the editor an opportunity to weld all of his material in one composite story. The editor should maintain a file of photographs, illustrations, novel ideas for presenting statistical information, and ideas for the layout and format.

### *Planning the Report*

BEFORE MAKING any layout, the editor must decide on the method of publication, taking into consideration the amount of copy, the number and kinds of illustrations, the number of copies to be produced, and of course the amount of money that is avail-

able. Before any decision can be made on the format, the quality of paper to be used, the number of copies to be run, or the method of production, the editor must know how much the budget can stand. After determining the budget for the report, the editor can get down to business.

A vital factor in determining the most desirable method of printing is the number of copies to be produced. Offset printing costs are usually lower than letter-press printing costs, particularly if many illustrations are to be used, and mimeographing is the cheapest of all (for very small editions). The biggest expenditure in regular printing is the initial cost of setting the copy in type and the engraving of illustrations. The cost naturally increases with the number of copies printed, but not proportionately. If plans call for only a few hundred copies to be printed, type-setting and engraving costs will be the major item of expense. If a large press run is planned, the paper and press-work will become proportionately a larger part of the over-all cost. Thus in a report of small circulation, such economies as are possible can be achieved in composition and engraving costs, while for the larger editions, substantial economies can be obtained by varying the number of pages and the quality of paper used.

### *Printing Methods*

WHENEVER ECONOMY is a prime requisite in the production of a report of small circulation, production methods other than printing can be used to advantage. The most commonly used processes—mimeograph and photo-offset—are much less expensive and more flexible than printing, and are used extensively in publications of this type. The outstanding virtue of mimeograph is economy. Its main drawback is unattractiveness, because illustrations must be restricted to simple line drawings and unappealing charts and graphs.

Most agencies with limited budgets use mimeograph for producing their annual reports and have thus consequently sacrificed reader appeal for economy. Very few have recognized the possibilities of offset, which offers the advantages of printing at

an economy comparable to mimeograph.<sup>2</sup> The flexibility of this process is a challenge to the ingenuity of the editor and the printer. Fundamentally, it is a photographic process. Reading matter can be typed, hand-lettered, or set in type. Almost any kind of photo, chart, cartoon, or other illustration can be reproduced. Photographs, wash drawings, and line drawings can be reproduced at a fraction of the cost of engravings. Good results depend largely on the quality of the master copy. If the copy is neat and attractive, the finished product should be the same.

If the proper equipment is accessible, a highly illustrated offset report with the master copies made from type can be published at less expense than the corresponding printed report, regardless of the number of copies. In smaller editions, economy is achieved principally through lower make-up and make-ready costs and by eliminating the added expense of engravings. In editions over 2,500 copies, additional savings are obtained through the lower running costs of the offset presses.

The New Orleans, Louisiana City Civil Service Department report for 1944 is an illustration of what can be done with the offset process. The copy was set in several faces of type with contrasting headlines. Statistics were presented in simple, appealing illustrations. The cover, made of light gray stock, contained four half-tone photographs of typical New Orleans scenes, with the name of the publication overprinted in red.

### *Attracting the Reader's Interest*

THE ANNUAL REPORT is an "unheralded" publication. Coming to the reader uninvited as it does, it must gain his immediate notice and interest him in its contents through its readability and attractiveness. Attractiveness means those qualities which

<sup>2</sup> Readers who are interested in the technical aspects of photo-offset and other printing processes will find the following two sources helpful: *Manual on Methods of Reproducing Research Materials*. Robert C. Binkley. Edwards Brothers, Inc., Ann Arbor, Michigan, 1936; and *The Practice of Printing*. Ralph W. Polk. The Manual Arts Press, Peoria, Illinois, 1926.

have the power to draw attention and sustain interest for more than just a moment. In attracting attention, a report appeals to the eye and to the mind. It appeals to the eye by the arrangement of its headlines, type color, and illustrations. Mind appeal, on the other hand, is contingent upon the content of these elements.

In designing a format, the whole report should be planned as a unit, and all details of production considered in relation to each other. For example, the use of half-tone illustrations will determine, to a certain extent, the kind of paper stock to be used. The paper, in turn, will affect the selection of type faces. And the type will have a bearing on the page and column sizes. Thorough planning in the beginning will eliminate costly delays, additional costs, and unsatisfactory results. The page size should be selected after a conference with the printer to determine the dimensions most adaptable to his equipment.

The size of type to be used will depend on the width of the printed area. The use of two columns will make it possible to use a smaller type size, for instance, than if the lines run the full width of the page. A four-inch line should ordinarily not be set in type smaller than 10 point. A six-inch line should be set in at least 12 point type. The lines should be spaced in proportion to the width of the type area and size of the type. One family or similar families of type should be used throughout the report.

Headings should stand out in contrast to the text. They should be forceful, relevant, and as short as possible. Contrast is obtained by using a larger, bolder face of type than that used in the text. A different style of type from the body may be used if it harmonizes with the body type.

Don't use illustrations only for the sake of illustrating or to fill up space. They should be used to complement the story—to help put the message across to the reader. They should be arranged on the page in such a way that the over-all effect of art work and copy is pleasing to the eye and in harmony with the report as a whole.

As a rule, statistical material can best be presented in an interesting, interpretive

manner through the use of pictographs or other novel methods of illustrating. The average person will not wade through a lot of unadorned, unexplained figures. In other words, statistics, if they are to mean anything at all to the reader, must put across a definite message, not just be a conglomeration of cold, factual numbers left for the reader to interpret. For example, the Sacramento, California, city report several years ago presented the costs of various public services in an illustrative table which compared the total monthly cost of such services to the average smoker's cigarette bill. Plain statistics could not have put across that message of municipal efficiency.

AS MENTIONED BEFORE, the choice of paper will depend largely on the method of printing to be used, the style of type, and the kinds of illustrations. When half-tone illustrations are to be used and the printing is done by the letter-press method, it will be necessary to use a finished or enameled paper. Soft papers are usually used in the offset process, even if half-tones are to be used. Paper should also be considered with reference to the selection of type. Some faces look better on hard finish stock; other on soft stock. A 60 or 70 pound weight of paper is considered the most desirable weight for the inside pages, and 100 or 120 pound stock for the cover. Cover stock should be colored, or "screen tinted" in the printing process.

The size of the publication and the number of pages should not be decided upon until after consultation with the printer. The printer's equipment will be the deciding factor if economy is to be observed. The most popular size publication is 8 1/2 by 11 inches because it requires less trimming of paper stocks, is adaptable to most presses, and is easily handled by the reader. An unusual size may have the appeal of novelty, but the waste in trimming and the necessity for a special mailing envelope may not be worth the added expense. It is advantageous to print as many pages as possible in one press run to save press time and to speed up binding. The number of pages in

the report should be a multiple of eight. Because the printer's press usually handles forms for eight or sixteen pages (depending on the size of the page), press work costs of a 34-page report will be almost as high as for a 40-page publication.

### *Preparing Copy*

ONE OF THE most important requisites in the make-up of a good report is proper copy preparation. It is also more economical in the long run, since printers charge for proof corrections of errors that are in the original manuscript. Copy should be typewritten, double spaced on regular 8 1/2 by 11 inch paper. Margins should be sufficiently wide for marking instructions for the typesetter, corrections, and insertions. It's also a good idea to make a note of the number of words at the top right corner of the page to facilitate preparation of the layout. When the printer receives the copy it should be in final form, for revising galley proofs is an expensive and time-wasting practice. Proofs are furnished to check type-setting errors—transpositions, wrong faces, faulty type, and other mistakes made by the printer—not for purposes of further editing.

Proofreading is plain, monotonous, eye-straining drudgery, but it's a job that has to be done right. No one will notice flawless proofreading, but a sloppy job will stick out like a sore thumb. Proofreading actually begins with the copy submitted to the printer. If it contains misspelled words and bad punctuation, so will the galley proof. For greater accuracy and speed, use a set of standard proofreader's marks, which can be obtained from most printing shops.

### *Effective Editorial Style*

THE REPORT must not only attract attention, but it must hold it. Art work, typography, and appealing illustrations invite a person to read the report, but they can't force him to read double-talk and long, sloppy sentences filled with high-sounding words that don't mean anything to anyone but a personnel official. According to the report of the Assembly's Committee on Public Relations, to which reference has

already been made, one of the reasons that has inhibited officials from developing readable public documents is "the legitimate fear of slipping over the borderline between public reporting and propaganda." In their efforts to escape accusations of issuing propaganda, writers of copy for governmental publications continue to pound out reams of dull, impersonal wordage. Most of it is a collection of pretentious, hackneyed phrases that beat around the bush. It gives the reader the impression that the author is reluctant to come out and say what he has to say in a straightforward manner for fear that someone will understand what it means. This ivory-tower attitude overloads the literature with false dignity and impressiveness.

Public personnel agencies must seek to accomplish two objectives by their annual reports: first, the gaining of an intelligent popular approval and acceptance of the need for a merit system of public personnel administration; and, second, disseminating information about methods and achievements in the professional field. Obviously one report can not do a thorough job of both. Readers in the first category—those indirectly concerned with good personnel practices—do not care to read long, technical dissertations. If the story is written "down" to the man-in-the-street level, its value to a personnel official will suffer. The report editor, then, must aim his story at both by using a simple, interesting, yet complete style which will have the maximum appeal to both types of reader.

Many governmental writers would do well to follow the example of the masters of plain talk—advertising copy writers. A veteran advertising man once declared that he could tell how long an advertiser had been in the field by the simplicity of the language used in his copy. Experience teaches an advertiser that simple, direct, and understandable language is the most effective.

As is the case in any type of writing, copy for the annual report should be concise. Tell the story in as few words as possible without sacrificing thoroughness and meaning. A good test for the usefulness of a word



is to see whether the meaning of the sentence is altered by its omission, or whether the sentence could be simplified by transposition. Conciseness is not obtained by eliminating words that would help the reader get the idea clearly, but rather by using every word effectively. Everyone who writes, particularly one whose job it is to write about difficult subjects in a language that can be understood, should familiarize himself with Rudolph Flesch's helpful book, *The Art of Plain Talk*.<sup>3</sup>

### *Distribution of the Report*

How MANY COPIES of the report should be published? Certainly it should be distributed to a maximum number of individuals whom we have grouped in the high-interest general publics: (1) the chief executive and elected officials, (2) heads of departments, agencies, and commissions, (3) personnel officers of the various organizational units, (4) employee groups, (5) members of the legislative body, (6) civic organizations, (7) newspapers, press associations, and radio stations, (8) college and university libraries, (9) research organizations, (10) veterans' organizations, (11) county and municipal officials, and (12) other public personnel agencies. Greater distribution may be made if the budget allows, but the agency should avoid a haphazard circulation. A few hundred copies should be held in reserve for future requests.

The members of the legislative body constitute the most important public as far as the personnel agency is concerned. They should be kept continuously informed of the personnel agency's accomplishments, problems, and plans. The agency's relations with the legislators—collectively and individually—present one of its most delicate tasks. The legislature may aid or hinder the operations of a public personnel agency within the constitutional provisions that exist. It can pave the way for the administration of a real merit system, or it can make the agency just a tool for patronage. A good report can be an excellent medium

for helping the legislator get an over-all picture of the agency's operations and to help him understand the difficulties and problems that arise and convince him of the necessity of solving them.

Quite often, legislation harmful to the personnel agency is the result of a single legislator's pet grievance against the agency. Legislative courtesy is a powerful weapon in persuading a committee to recommend or report unfavorably on a bill to hamper the effectiveness of a merit system program. Man-to-man contacts are vitally necessary in friendly relations between the politician and the personnel official, but an effective report can at least lay the ground work of understanding.<sup>4</sup>

Special reports on particular problems should be distributed to members of the legislature, but it is left to the annual report to educate the legislators on the over-all program. They are usually flooded with pamphlets, reports, and other literature. They haven't the time or the desire to read lengthy, unattractive publications, and to be of any use at all in this important aspect of public relations, the report must be at least interesting and as brief as possible even to get attention.

A personnel agency is a service organization for all divisions of the state government. To be of maximum service to the various departments and to the government as a whole, there must be complete understanding and cooperation between the agency and the chiefs and personnel officers of the line departments. Here again the annual report can perform an educational function. Furthermore, a civil service system must do some "inside" as well as "outside" selling. The employees themselves can and should do the major part of

<sup>4</sup> The Assembly's Committee on Public Relations cites the following case to show how inadequately informed legislators can hamper the operations of a merit system: "A few years ago, one state civil service commission lost an excellent opportunity to obtain a much needed appropriation because of its failure to explain its needs intelligently and convincingly. Two years later the increase was approved by the legislative committee without any ado, but only after the committee came to understand the real work and problems of the personnel agency and to appreciate the utter necessity for the increase."

<sup>3</sup> Rudolph Flesch, *The Art of Plain Talk*. Harper and Bros., New York, 1946.



the selling job. Their understanding of and confidence in the work of the agency is reflected in the attitudes of friends and associates outside the service, and eventually in those of the public in general. Since the cost of supplying each employee with a copy of the report would be prohibitive, distribution must be limited to key personnel—district supervisors, county officials, division chiefs, and other similar persons. These persons can then circulate copies to their subordinates.

The civic groups rank high on the list of publics. These include the people who are natural friends of the merit system principle—those who accept and support the program of the agency in its entirety—and those groups whose interest covers special aspects of the agency's activities. Generally speaking, these groups are largely responsible for the adoption of merit systems, and have fought for their continuance. Once the reform phase is passed, the agency must see that their interest and support is maintained.

The press and radio can serve a two-fold purpose with regard to the annual report. They can publicize the report itself and can use the contents as raw material for news and feature items.

Educational institutions deserve special attention of the personnel agency because of their importance as a source of recruits and as a sounding board for determining the attitude of the citizens of tomorrow toward the public service. The promising student has been led to believe that public service offers no future, or opportunities

for a well-paid career. Too many young people look upon employment in government as the last refuge of incompetence. The prestige of government service has never been very high and never will be unless the agencies themselves take on the task of raising it through education.

### Summary

A WELL-CONCEIVED annual report, attractively presented, can serve a highly useful purpose in building understanding, good will, and public support of the public personnel agency's program. In too many instances, however, civil service agencies overlook the public-relations potentialities of their reports, and consider them merely as the fulfillment of a legal requirement.

Producing an effective report calls for careful planning, imagination, some skill in writing, and a working knowledge of the graphic arts. Of the various common printing processes, the photo-offset process is one of the most flexible and economical for the needs of the average small or medium-size agency.

To accomplish its intended purposes, the report must not only be prepared with its primary objectives in mind, but once produced, it should be distributed judiciously. Among the "publics" to which the annual report has high potential interest are (1) members of the legislature, (2) department heads and other administrative officials, (3) employee groups, (4) educational, research, and civic organizations, (5) the press and radio, and (6) other personnel agencies.

# Civil Service in Oregon— A Two-Year Progress Report

WILLIAM G. COLMAN  
AND ROBERT R. JOHNSON

THE PURPOSE of this discussion is not to present a strictly chronological account of the installation of a merit system in Oregon. Such a presentation would be repetitive and would cover points of common knowledge in the field of public personnel administration. During the past several years, a number of articles have appeared in personnel journals ably dealing with experiences and problems encountered in developing and installing civil service systems.<sup>1</sup>

Rather, although some duplication is inevitable, the writers hope to indicate those steps in the installation process in Oregon which may have departed from existing practices and to emphasize an administrative approach to the personnel program in Oregon which may vary to a greater or less degree from generally applied practices in the field of public personnel administration. During the war years there were relatively few new civil service programs established; it is hoped that the ideas which went into the Oregon program, while not original, may nevertheless provide food for thought for those considering new merit system programs as well as for present workers in this field.

<sup>1</sup> See I. J. Browder, "The Alabama State Merit System—A Report of Progress," *Public Personnel Review*, April, 1941, pp. 101-5; Kenneth C. Pennebaker, "Civil Service in Minnesota—The First Eighteen Months," *Public Personnel Review*, April, 1941, pp. 106-13; and Maxwell A. Devoe and Edward H. Litchfield, "Rhode Island Installs Civil Service," *Public Personnel Review*, April, 1941, pp. 114-22.

• WILLIAM G. COLMAN is Director of the Oregon State Civil Service Commission, presently on leave of absence. He was formerly a Lieutenant, U.S.N.R. attached to the Bureau of Naval Personnel.

• ROBERT R. JOHNSON is Assistant Director of the Oregon State Civil Service Commission, presently serving as Acting Director. He was formerly a staff member of Public Administration Service.

## *Political, Legislative and Administrative Background*

EACH POLITICAL JURISDICTION presents special local problems. Personnel practices are normally adapted to the peculiar conditions prevailing in the jurisdiction. In many respects the state of Oregon is a typical state jurisdiction; other features of the social, economic and political structure are unusual and comprise apparent contrasts and inconsistencies.

Politically, Oregon is a conservative state and traditionally Republican. At the same time, the state's approach to many social and economic problems have been markedly progressive. Much New Deal legislation at the national level finds its counterpart on the statute books of Oregon. The state renders unusually intensive and extensive governmental services to its citizens in such fields as industrial safety, workmen's compensation, agriculture, public health and vocational education, among others.

Structurally, Oregon is characterized by a "weak executive" form of government. Under the constitution, there is a definite philosophy of separation and dilution of power, not only among the three branches of government, but within the executive branch itself. For example, the Governor, the Secretary of State and the State Treasurer comprise a "State Board of Control;" this Board, not the Governor alone, exercises supervision over all state hospitals and institutions and over many functions of general state administration, including purchasing and property control. The functions of the state are distributed among sixty-odd departments and commissions. The lines of authority stemming from the Governor to departmental administrators are much less clear and strong

than is the case in many state jurisdictions. The state, in line with its philosophy of separation of powers, has relied heavily on part-time and full-time boards and commissions in administration.

Although restricted by an organizational and administrative structure which may not be technically sound, Oregon, for the past several years, has enjoyed among its elective and administrative officials a degree of competency above that found in many states. Most departmental administrators are technically expert in their fields. A spoils system, in its usual sense, has not existed for many years in the state government. This point is noted because the civil service law enacted at the 1945 session came into being in a political environment not usually typical of many original civil service laws. The civil service law and a retirement law passed concurrently resulted largely through concerted efforts of state employees. The employees were motivated principally by a belief that civil service would bring higher pay scales and by the belief that although political dismissals were rare, future qualities or attitudes of administrators could not be foreseen, so that laws affording security of tenure and an actuarially sound retirement plan were desirable steps toward bettering employment conditions in the state service as well as hedging against an uncertain future.

The Oregon act was patterned closely after the model law of the National Civil Service League, deviating only in minor respects. A point deserving mention is the "open back door" provision in the act. This provision was one of the principal selling points in the passage of the law, particularly in overcoming initial adverse reactions of departmental administrators and business and tax-payer interests to civil service legislation. Recent attempts to change this provision have not met with any significant support from employees.

In summary, the Civil Service Commission, upon assuming its duties, found itself with a completely workable statute and an administrative environment relatively free from political entanglements. On the other hand, unlike most new installations there

was a marked lack of enthusiasm or aggressive support from any reform movement, the press, civic groups, or state administrators. The general attitude was: "What will civil service contribute to the betterment or efficiency of the state service? Political interference and patronage abuses are negligible; our budgetary and financial system is efficient, and employees already enjoy security of tenure." It was against this background, both favorable and unfavorable in nature, that the Civil Service Commission embarked on its task.

#### *Initial Approach and Development*

SHORTLY AFTER passage of the act, the Governor appointed a Civil Service Commission of three members, all of whom were outstanding and respected citizens in their communities. Two had previously served on state commissions. Consequently, a somewhat greater than average familiarity with state operating problems was existent within the commission membership. This factor did much to allay initial misgivings of departmental administrators who feared an impractical approach to their problems by the central civil service agency. A director was selected in the usual manner by a nation-wide open competitive examination. Under the foregoing conditions, the Commission and Director approached their task with the general attitude of giving administrative views of operating officials full recognition. The Commission believed its principal potential contribution to be one of improvement, standardization and simplification of personnel processes, rather than the installation of a reform program which would "keep the rascals out" and go to extreme lengths to protect the so-called merit principle.

Recognizing the prevailing conservative philosophy with respect to state revenue and fiscal policies, and not overlooking the fact that a large proportion of state appropriations go into salaries and wages, the Commission took early steps to integrate the personnel system with that of budget administration. Likewise, the Commission decided to encourage as well as rely upon the continuing advice and recommenda-

tions of department heads, not only in the installation of the system but in its administration. Provision was made in the rules for the appointment by the Commission of a Personnel Advisory Committee consisting of three departmental administrators. The members of this Committee serve staggered terms extending up to six months. The functions of the committee were outlined by the Commission and consisted principally of serving as an advisory group to the Commission and Director in the formulation and administration of major state personnel policies.

It may be said that the type of approach outlined above has a certain element of danger for the future of a new personnel agency. Such an approach allegedly might place the personnel agency in the position of bending over backwards to concede to and compromise with operating officials, thereby lessening its dignity and weakening its stature in the official family of the jurisdiction. Up to this point such has not proven to be true. The reader may undoubtedly recall, however, civil service commissions which became either personnel agencies in name only or suffered undying and repressive criticism for initially approaching their mission with an overly idealistic attitude, a multiplicity of forms, procedures and controls, and a startling array of "technicians."

#### *Classification and Pay Plans*

AS IN OTHER new installations, the Commission contracted with an outside organization for aid in establishing classification and pay plans and assisting the Commission in an advisory capacity until the Commission was able to complete its own staffing. The advantages of such outside consultative aid are apparent. However, in arranging contracts for such projects, the following suggestions are offered to new agencies that may be seeking such services. First, if at all possible, the complete scope of work to be done should be determined and bids for the performance of the complete project reviewed. Open end contracts probably are most desirable since the agency can require its own standards and

terminate the work when it believes necessary steps have been completed. Such a contractual arrangement may occasionally be inexpedient. In the case of fixed amount contracts, it is recommended that economy be given consideration only after determination on quantity and quality of service required. The writers would additionally require statements of names and qualifications of at least the key personnel who are to be assigned by the survey group and would conduct additional investigation as to work experience of such persons. Finally, the personnel agency should from the outset plan on devoting the time of its own staff to a considerable portion of the project. This latter is an added cost, and perhaps inconvenient, but normally it more than compensates for the time devoted in terms of staff training and understanding of results.

The development of the Oregon classification and pay plans generally speaking, followed methods usually employed in new installations. These survey procedures have been discussed by other writers, particularly Baruch.<sup>2</sup> The development of these plans afforded the first test of cooperation between the budgetary and personnel agencies.

It was believed that work in the development of classification and pay structures would necessarily require close cooperation with the state budget division. This agency had been exercising a close control over both general and specific salary adjustments in the majority of state departments. There was initially a fear on the part of budget and administrative authorities that the civil service program, representing essentially an employee viewpoint, would carry on its activities without reference to administrative requirements or the state's financial condition. The contemplated classification and pay processes were therefore discussed thoroughly both as to policy and procedure before being put into operation. This cooperative approach resulted in improvements not only for the personnel agency but also in more effective

<sup>2</sup> See also *Position Classification in the Public Service*, Civil Service Assembly.

and simplified budget control over salaries and wages. Without the aid of the State Budget Director, the Commission's work in gathering data and presenting and obtaining acceptance of pay recommendations would have been much more difficult. The writers suggest that in many jurisdictions where a conflict exists between budget and personnel concepts, such conflicts may be beneficially resolved if both parties take less of an arbitrary stand and honestly attempt to cooperate in working out points of difficulty. If such mutual cooperation can be achieved the results will more than compensate for the time expended.

The classification plan is generally similar to such plans of many other agencies. An attempt was made to develop broad classes for budget simplicity and better understanding on the part of the uninitiated. Existing classification plans which had been developed by the state budget division for budget use proved extremely useful as the civil service plans were developed.

The Oregon law permits considerable administrative discretion in the use of examination options. Selective certifications, believed by the writers to be administratively necessary to effective personnel processes, was provided by rule of the Commission. It was therefore possible to consolidate into single class groupings positions which were basically comparable as to nature and level of work but might require special treatment in the original selective processes. Examples are departmental program heads who were grouped together in simple categories, such as Agriculture Executive, Civil Engineer, or Public Health Physician, although in each case, optional fields in the form of sub-classes would be established in setting up examinations and eligible lists. Where law does not permit selective certification it is believed that class concepts must necessarily be greater in number and finer in differentiation.

IN DEVELOPING the pay plan, once class concepts were evolved, principal consideration was given to relating the plan with salary

scales paid in private employment in the state under similar working conditions. Internal class comparisons, of course, served as the basic guide. Pay data were also obtained from other public jurisdictions, labor unions, and other sources. These latter data however were used principally for a reference rather than as a basis for establishing the absolute values in the pay plan.

Three of the principal problems which had to be faced were: (1) Pay scales for many of the state departments, particularly those in general-fund departments, were low in terms of any outside comparisons; (2) general state pay scales were abnormally influenced by a statutory ceiling of \$5,000 which represented most department head salary rates. Salary rate differentials as between routine and responsible positions were thus compressed within a narrow range. (3) There were many disparities between salary rates paid for similar types of work as between those departments which operated on general fund revenues and those which were self-sustaining.

The possible use of a point rating or factor comparison plan for pay valuations was given consideration. The development of such a plan on an adequate basis was believed to be sufficiently time consuming and costly as to preclude its application. Additionally there was question as to actual practical advantage in objectivity or ease of administration over the more standard class comparison and ranking methods. The use of desirable elements of point rating and factor comparison methods will be applied on an informal basis to allocation and pay problems by the Commission in its administration of the classification and pay plans.

The pay plan finally proposed brought the state pay levels more nearly in line with private economy in the state. Likewise the old differentials between different departments for the same type of work were eliminated. While the resultant salary scales were not completely to the satisfaction of all employees or department heads, generally it was agreed that the standardization had been an important step toward resolving the salary problem. The extent to



which the salary plan will be able to meet changing conditions has yet to be determined. The Commission avoided, however, setting up a technical salary adjustment program based upon cost of living indices, believing that recognition should be given changes in living costs only after consideration of other factors which would also affect salary level determinations.

In developing the structure of the pay plan it was believed that the first step should be to get all classes of employment into comparable pay groupings, based on an evaluation of their relative responsibility. As a result all classes were assigned to one of twenty-six pay levels, each of which carried a spread of approximately 30 per cent from minimum to maximum, ranging from a basic minimum rate of \$130 per month to a maximum of \$600 per month in the classified service. It was recognized that this salary range concept was not completely consistent with prevailing methods of salary or wage payment for certain types of workers. It was believed, nevertheless, that while special adjustment could be made if necessary, it was a matter of first importance that all employees in the classified service be compensated according to similar conditions as a matter of uniform state policy. Both the classification and pay plans underwent public hearings. As a result of final hearings many changes were made. The final plan resulted in a substantial increase in governmental cost for the state but was given complete approval by the legislative at its last session.

Provision was made in rules and regulations that deviations from regular salary adjustment practices should receive the joint approval of the Civil Service Department and the Budget Director before becoming effective. While the law provided that salary advancements within ranges should be based on merit rather than being automatic, it did not specify the means by which the normal tendency to automatic increases (which are believed undesirable) would be avoided. The Commission decided that the best insurance for salary advancements based on merit lay not in integration of the salary plan with a service

rating system (which method has been found universally wanting), but to limit salary advancements to a biennial percentage of total payroll, such percentage to be fixed by the Budget Director.

This method does not ordinarily allow sufficient funds for advancement of all employees every time they become eligible by length of service, but it does permit advancement of a considerable proportion (from 40 to 80 per cent, depending on turnover). The departmental administrator thereby must decide which employees are to receive step increases at each pay adjustment date. When faced with this problem, most administrators will conscientiously try to select the most satisfactory employees for advancement. Under this plan salary increments are not complacently awaited, but most employees are motivated to more energetic efforts in the hope of qualifying for advancement.

An important result of the pay plan was a subsequent legislative review of unclassified salary rates and upward revision of such rates for all state officials, including the Governor. The Civil Service Commission was also directed by the legislature to make a thorough study of all state salary problems and bring in its recommendations prior to the next legislative session. This action expanded the Civil Service Commission's activities in this regard to include all unclassified as well as classified positions in pay plan consideration.

#### *Personnel Transactions*

REPORTING of personnel transactions presented opportunity for simplifying personnel procedure. As a result of thorough study and departmental conferences, a single personnel action form was developed to apply to all basic personnel actions. This was accompanied by a decentralization of leave and attendance record keeping to individual departments, with uniform policies specified by the Commission. The Commission, with the joint participation of the State Audits Division, encouraged and assisted in the installation of complete personnel record systems in the departments which requested aid. Such

assistance provided for complete payroll, retirement and civil service records at a central point in each department.

By virtue of the above procedure the Commission eliminated the usual record duplication common to those civil service agencies which are required to keep leave and attendance records, reserving for itself only a basic roster record necessary for payroll check and certification. Internal departmental controls of personnel were improved and a number of previously existing forms were eliminated.

### *Examination and Certification*

THE OREGON Civil Service Act, as originally adopted, provided that employees entering the classified service after September, 1940 (the date of activation of National Guard units in Oregon prior to World War II) receive status as conditional employees, subject to successful competition in tests to be conducted no sooner than one year after the termination of the war. By January 1, 1947, about 85 per cent of the 9,000 employees in the classified service were in such a category. Through intensive efforts at the 1947 legislative assembly, and with the support of many department heads and other interested groups, the Commission secured an amendment, permitting the blanketing-in of such employees. Under the amendment employees with less than six months of service are granted probationary status, receiving permanent status upon the completion of the remainder of the probationary period. By this amendment the problem of examining incumbents, which has been a terrific headache for many jurisdictions, has been eliminated.

The amendment was somewhat unusual in that it does not blanket in as of a specific date, but as of the date of establishment of eligible lists, class by class. The disadvantage of not being able to examine all provisionals within a short period was thus eliminated. The writers would strongly urge that any new personnel jurisdiction beginning operations with requirements of examination of incumbents, give every consideration to attempting to secure remedial

action. Many legislative bodies do not fully appreciate the administrative problems involved in an examination program under which employees must meet open competition for their present positions. On the other hand, such legislative bodies, when fully acquainted with all the ramifications of such a requirement, will often agree to a blanketing-in provision. In frequent instances new personnel agencies have, through no fault of their own, acquired much ill will and many vocal enemies as a result of employee mortality in competitive examinations. Such a qualifying program is, of necessity, usually conducted with considerable haste, resultant error, and in any case, complete disruption of employee morale.

The Oregon Commission officially assumed the functions and responsibilities of the former Merit System Council in the spring of 1946. Since this date, the Commission has conducted a number of examinations for those agencies subject to grant-in-aid provisions of the federal Social Security Act. Examination policies, procedures and forms which have been developed can be readily extended to the remainder of the state service as the statewide examination program gets under way.

With respect to examinations, the Commission felt it imperative to rely to the fullest extent possible on the advice and assistance of operating officials. When a tentative examination draft has been completed, it is checked with the classification section as to the relevancy of the test to the duties of the class. After making appropriate modifications, the draft is then reviewed with the operating agencies and the items are gone over in detail. Conferences on the latter points may require as long as one or two days. During this process many items are found which are technically incorrect, irrelevant, confusing, or otherwise undesirable. Operating officials, upon suggesting the deletion or revision of any item, are encouraged to suggest substitute items or appropriate changes in wording of items.

The objective of these clearances is to evolve a written test which all concerned

agree to be a technically sound selection device and a practical tool for measuring the abilities of the candidates. The test is then administered in the form as finally agreed upon in the conference. Two important advantages accrue from the use of the procedure outlined above: (a) examinations are improved upon with resultant reduction in the number of appeals based on faulty items; (b) in the case of employee appeals, the personnel agency can gain support from operating officials in defending the practicality of the written test.<sup>3</sup>

In its examination procedures the Commission has restricted emphasis on the oral interview, even for so-called public contact positions such as caseworkers and employment interviewers. Use of orals has been confined to top administrative or technical positions where it is possible to obtain the services of a single oral examining board of outstanding calibre to examine a relatively small number of candidates. The Commission believes that, generally speaking, the appointing authority through the employment interview subsequent to certification, is in a better position than the personnel agency to judge personality attributes of candidates in relation to the specific positions for which they are being considered. In its restricted emphasis on the oral interview the Commission feels that it has sacrificed little in terms of testing procedure and has economized considerably in time and money.

In the evaluation of training and experience, attempt was made to simplify and abbreviate formal procedures wherever possible. In lieu of using highly complex mathematical formulae for ascertaining exact numerical ratings (sometimes to the second or third decimal place) for the training and experience portion of the examination, a method similar to that followed in position classification has been used.

<sup>3</sup> For further discussion of this procedure, see Jean Charters, "Cooperation Between a Personnel Agency and Operating Departments in Making Decisions About Examination Questions and Answers," *Case Reports in Public Administration*: No. 55, Public Administration Service, Chicago, Illinois, 1941.

Where fewer than 100 candidates are being rated, the personnel examiner reads each record thoroughly, giving considerable attention to all the pertinent factors appearing in the record, including age, earning power, progressiveness of experience, the "quality" of the educational institution which the candidate attended, and other factors which ordinarily are not evaluated in the usual type of rating. After such study, the examiner places the file in one of several "stacks" grouped for example, in five-point intervals—70, 75, 80, 85, 90, 95. After reviewing each application and placing it in what he feels to be the most appropriate group, the groups are thoroughly rechecked, discussed with other examiners and borderline cases moved upward or downward.

Concurrently with the "grouping" process described above, rating standards begin to emerge—the factors which differentiate one group of applicants from the next higher or lower group. When the process has been completed a reasonable and logical set of qualifications standards has evolved for the class. This set of standards may be compared with the class specification, and the grouping process is identical with that used in allocating a considerable number of positions in a classification survey. In other words, the techniques of position classification in grouping position duties into appropriate classes has been similarly applied to the evaluation of training and experience—the grouping of applicant qualifications into appropriate categories. This process has worked successfully. It has been found that several so-called subjective factors, which bear heavily upon the actual fitness of candidates and which are not measured in the ordinary type of rating, are adequately recognized.

The Oregon act provides a strict procedure for use of promotional examinations. All promotion tests must be competitive in nature and a vacancy filled by certification from the top three names on the list. It is the belief of the writers that the interference of the personnel agency in the exercise of departmental judgment in the

matter of promotions should be minimized wherever possible. Major emphasis is given in promotional examinations to supervisory evaluations of relative merit and evaluations of experience and training. Some may feel that this procedure defeats one of the principal purposes of a promotional examination in that it tends to permit personal favoritism on the part of departmental administrators. This may occasionally be true; however, it is felt that the number of cases in which unfair discrimination occurs will be offset many times by a more valid ranking of candidates.

### *Employee Evaluation and Training*

THE DEVELOPMENT of a service rating program was approached with a lack of enthusiasm. This attitude was motivated by the lack of real effectiveness observed in service rating systems of other jurisdictions. This observation has as a corollary that despite wide variations in rating forms and techniques, service rating programs are always limited in their effectiveness by the attitudes and skills of higher level administrative and supervisory personnel. Effectiveness of such systems also varies in a single jurisdiction between departments.

Largely as a result of this thinking the Commission attempted to develop a brief and simple form which would serve as a standard for all departments. This form was printed on one side of an 8½ x 11 inch sheet. The Commission then encouraged and stimulated departments individually to develop more detailed and specific rating traits or procedures which would satisfy their particular needs. A more detailed rating form could be printed on the back of the original standard form or used as a supplementary form by departments.

By taking this approach the Civil Service Commission placed itself in a research and advisory capacity, rather than a controlling one. The result of this approach to the problem has been a greater acceptance of procedures and objectives on the part of department heads. Many departments have wholeheartedly entered into the problem of service ratings within their own units and have evolved individual programs

which will be much more useful than would have been the case had a "cut and dried" system been imposed upon them. In addition, the Civil Service Department will have an opportunity to review the effect of different departmental methods, still retaining a basic standard form and procedure. For example, one large state department plans to include self-rating as well as supervisory rating for all employees; another department plans to establish a rating committee for the rating of each employee's performance.

The true worth of any such plan lies in its use by departments to commend meritorious service and to point out weaknesses in order that employee efficiency may be improved and employee morale bolstered. The Civil Service Commission in its service rating program is attempting to achieve this objective. Unlike many plans, the Oregon system will not provide for salary adjustments on the basis of individual ratings.

THE CIVIL SERVICE PROGRAM, up to the present time, has only scratched the surface insofar as training activities are concerned. Under the civil service law, a fairly rigid in-service promotional program is set forth. With such a policy, added responsibility is placed on the central personnel agency and the various departments in the development of departmental staffs. Only by such measures can stagnation on the part of employees be obviated. The Civil Service Commission again views its part in this activity as being principally one of stimulating departments in developing their own training programs and assisting them in an advisory capacity in every way possible. There are interdepartmental training activities where the Commission participation becomes more direct. The existence of other training agencies available to the state will undoubtedly be relied upon heavily. The State Department of Vocational Education is equipped and financed in such a way as to prove of great value in preparing and stimulating necessary training activities. Except for special situations, it is unlikely that the Civil Service



Commission will ever become the supervising or training agency for staff development programs.

### *Employee Relations*

FROM THE OUTSET, it has been the consensus of those administering the Oregon civil service program that the highly formalized type of employee relations was to be avoided in every way possible. The official policies of the Civil Service Commission in terms of classification, salaries, working hours, and general working conditions are made clear through written and verbal media. These are subject to question or review at any time by supervisors or employees. Every question is weighed as conscientiously as possible but with full consideration given to all relative values for the best interests of the state as a whole. It is believed that acceptance of employee relations determinations are conditioned largely on the mutual trust and respect which exists between the participants in any question. To date this approach has been successful. Under the stress of unusual economic conditions or other special situations, a long-term test of the effectiveness of such policy remains to be seen.

Oregon employees, in terms of organization, fall roughly into three categories: (1) unaffiliated employees who at present time approximate a third to a half of the state service; (2) employees of the AFL State, County and Municipal Employees, or specific AFL craft groups whose exact numbers are not known; (3) employees of the State Employees' Association, whose membership comprises approximately a third to a half of the state service. The latter group is an independent association and numbers in its membership members of certain of the AFL craft groups. To the writers' knowledge there is no CIO membership. The organized employee groups, generally speaking, were largely responsible for the passage of the original act and for protecting it against undesirable legislative amendments at the last legislative session. Despite the influence of the employee groups, the Civil Service Commission has steadfastly refused to become asso-

ciated as directly representing the views of employee groups, departments or any other groups in state affairs.

The writers have experienced in Oregon a situation which they have found in other jurisdictions, namely, that most department heads are sincerely interested for personal reasons or otherwise, in the interests of their own employees. Many times the personnel agency makes a determination based on an overall service viewpoint which is approved neither by the department head nor individual employees affected. This point is mentioned primarily to indicate that the frequently encountered employee attitude of suspicion toward the department head, at least in many public jurisdictions, is not well-founded.

The Civil Service Commission, in dealing with employee suggestions, criticisms, or grievances, maintains and will continue to maintain as long as it can, an open-door policy, to any employee whether he is a member of an affiliated group or not, or with any representatives of employees who are speaking for their respective groups. This viewpoint again is one which is not shared by those who believe that dealings are more effective when only one or a few bargaining units are involved. The Civil Service Commission is convinced that a major step toward suitable relations with employees is gained if all concerned are honestly informed of the personnel policies to be followed and the reasons for such policies.

### *Concluding Observations*

IN CLOSING this discussion the writers take license to make a few general observations. One is that civil service or "modern" personnel administration is not yet generally accepted by political, budgetary, and administrative officials in the same light that the personnel administrator views the problem. A great deal of give and take is necessary in bringing such officials to a greater appreciation of the values of more objective methods in personnel practice. Personnel people sometimes overlook this, particularly under the stress of establishing a new program. The resulting unfavorable



effect oftentimes requires prolonged effort by the personnel agency to achieve a practicable program. We in Oregon, as well as the other personnel administrators, might well take stock of ourselves to find out whether some of our established fetishes cannot be discarded, and more thought given to some very real problems that budgetary and administrative officials face.

Another observation concerns the very human reaction against certain of the types of federal supervision with which the state personnel administrator must deal in developing and administering an acceptable personnel program. Our observations are made with full awareness of the very cooperative relationships which most federal agencies have shown our staff, and without overlooking the very substantial merit system gains which the various federal agencies, particularly the Social Security Administration, have fostered. It is unpleasant, none the less, in any state, which is relatively free from political domination in its personnel program and has competent administrative leadership, to have what are in our opinion unreasonable "musts" in the way of purely technical and administrative detail forced upon the personnel agency, with the withholding of federal funds as the alternative. The Oregon Civil Service Commission, while recognizing that such mandates necessarily stem from the administration of nation-wide policies, has resisted unreasonable technical requirements which impose hardships on sound administration of the state services. We feel that much of mutual benefit would be derived from a reconsideration of the whole problem of state-federal merit system relationships.

The foregoing discussion reflects the writers' view that now is perhaps the appropriate time for a serious and objective re-evaluation of the role of the personnel technician or administrator in public administration. This view may spring from the frequent occasions on which personnel policy cannot be defended in the face of honest questions except by an arbitrary "take it or leave it" statement or premise. A shift in emphasis is needed, and indeed has

already begun in some jurisdictions, from the traditional protective and control features of civil service systems to a more positive approach. To relax a few controls and to substitute a series of service programs is not enough. As the cost of general government increases, the civil service administrator, like all other public officials, must critically review his operations to insure that his agency is performing at optimum effectiveness and without unnecessary or duplicating procedures. The public personnel agency should be able to show citizens and taxpayers a tangible saving in general governmental costs more than equal to the direct and indirect costs of the personnel program itself.

Applying this yardstick to two years of civil service administration in Oregon, the writers believe that the accomplishments probably outweigh the cost. The principal contribution of the Oregon agency thus far lies in the establishment of a uniform system of classification and pay which has helped considerably in the processes of budget preparation, budget administration and legislative consideration of salary and wage appropriations. The personnel program has probably resulted in somewhat higher employee morale and in an increased awareness of departmental administrators of their responsibilities in the area of personnel management. Likewise, the Commission's activities in recruiting on an informal basis under present labor market conditions are on the credit side of the ledger. With respect to service ratings and examinations, statutory provisions have been complied with, but it is doubtful whether these two phases, up to the present, at least, have improved state services or increased department efficiency and employee morale to a degree commensurate with their cost.

One indication of the personnel program's acceptance has been its first legislative test. The Civil Service Commission sponsored and, with assistance from department heads and other interested groups, obtained legislative approval of amendments aimed at improving administration of the act. These amendments meant a

substantial savings to the state both in tangible and intangible costs. A few amendments aimed at weakening the program were introduced or tentatively advanced. Except for a single minor amendment, all were defeated before reaching any advanced stage. It would thus appear that to date public reaction has at least not been unfavorable to the personnel program.

Despite the possibly pessimistic tone of many of our remarks, it is believed that by continued application of the philosophy outlined in this discussion, the Oregon Civil Service Commission can continue to occupy its modest place in the state government, confident of its worth and justifying its existence by a reasonable but not a complacent margin.

---

## Hatch Act Upheld

The constitutionality of the Hatch Act prohibiting political activity by federal employees and state and local employees whose salaries are paid in whole or in part out of federal funds or federal grants-in-aid was upheld by the Supreme Court on February 10, 1947. The test case was brought by the United Public Workers of America (CIO) in behalf of an employee of the U. S. Mint at Philadelphia and several others who had been dismissed from their positions for serving as poll workers on election day in 1940. It was contended on the part of the employees that the Hatch Act, which forbids such employees from taking "any active part in political management or in political campaigns" was an infringement on the constitutional prerogatives of such employees as citizens, impairing their freedom of speech, etc.

The Supreme Court, by a divided vote, maintained that the authority of the Congress to legislate in regard to conditions of employment in the federal service is broad enough to preclude restrictions on the political activity of persons paid out of federal funds so long as such restrictions do not interfere with the employee's right to exercise the elective franchise. Justice Stanley Reed, in writing the majority opinion, maintained that the Hatch Act forbids only the partisan activity of federal and state personnel paid out of federal funds deemed offensive to efficiency, and that the Hatch Act "leaves untouched full participation by employees in political decisions at the ballot box." He held further that when any actions of civil servants in the judgment of Congress menace the integrity and competency of the service, legislation to forestall such danger is required. The court contended that Congress properly sought to regulate the political activities of government employees over which it has jurisdiction by adoption of the Hatch Act to meet this need. "We cannot say that these restrictions are unconstitutional," stated the court. (*United Public Workers of America, CIO v. Mitchell, et al*,

Advance Opinion No. 20, Oct., 1946, Term.)

In another case involving the issue of whether the United States Civil Service Commission could validly withhold funds from a state government where the state persisted in rehiring one of its employees who had been found guilty of violating the Hatch Act, the court sustained the authority of the Commission to do so. The case involved an employee of the highway department in the state of Oklahoma, where the highway commissioner was found to have served as chairman of the State Democratic Committee, although he had resigned his political position after investigation had been undertaken by the Civil Service Commission. The Commission ordered twice the amount of the employee's salary withheld from the road fund grants made available to the state. The state of Oklahoma challenged the authority of the Civil Service Commission to exact the penalty on the ground that the federal government had no right to interfere in the internal affairs of the state and that the Hatch Act was an unconstitutional impingement on the state's rights. The court held, in a five to two decision, that Congress could determine the "conditions under which grants-in-aid to the states could be made and could authorize the U. S. Civil Service Commission to withhold part of the funds otherwise made available to a state where it finds that the conditions sought to be enforced by the Congress had been wilfully ignored. (*State of Oklahoma v. U. S. Civil Service Commission*.)

## Authority to Classify and Fix Pay

Personnel administrators sometimes interpret authority to classify positions as carrying with it authority to determine the salaries of positions in the public service. Whether a personnel agency has authority to fix salaries of employees as distinguished from determining the salary grades of positions (that is, the maxima and minima of each salary grade) depends on the authority granted by statute, either expressly or by implication. In most instances in the absence of express authority the courts have questioned implied authority of personnel agencies to fix compensation. Instead, the court views the power to fix salaries as a responsibility of the legislative branch or the fiscal authorities to whom it is usually delegated.

• H. ELIOT KAPLAN is Executive Secretary, National Civil Service League. He is a member of the faculty of New York University, and is a practicing member of the New York Bar. Mr. A. I. Goldberg, a member of the New York Bar, assists Mr. Kaplan in editing "Legal Notes."

A case in point is one recently decided by the Colorado Supreme Court, *Vivian et al v. Bloom et al*, 177 P. (2d) 541, where the issue arose as to whether the legislature or the civil service commission had the authority to fix salaries of state employees. The court held that the legislature has plenary authority over compensation to be paid to employees of the state unless such authority is restricted by the constitution. It held the civil service commission to be a public agency of limited jurisdiction, having only such powers as the constitution and the statute creating it have given it.

The court held that the determination of the classification of positions based on duties performed and standardization as to grades was vested in the civil service commission. It maintained, however, that the power to classify positions did not carry with it by necessary implication the power in the civil service commission to fix compensation, holding on the theory that the salary of an office or position is an incident to the office or position, whereas classification of a position is based on certain standard specifications as to work to be done. Neither does the authority to fix compensation of positions carry with it control over classification of positions, so that the legislature has no control over the latter, which is vested in the civil service commission.

The court pointed out further that while the legislature may fix the pay of positions within the classified service of the state, it could not determine the salary to be paid to any individual employee; that it could fix only the salary of each class or grade established by the commission. Only in that way could there be assured, the court contended, that salaries for persons having like classifications would be equal. The court reaffirmed its earlier ruling that the legislature in appropriating funds for payment of salaries to state employees must fix the salaries in accordance with the classification and grading of positions as determined by the civil service commission; and the authority of the commission to classify and grade "may not be undermined by fixing salaries separately for the employees of different departments or by any other device." The legislature has authority "to limit appropriation, but no authority thereby to change the salary of one or more employees from that established for the entire class and grade in which they are classified. Employees must be paid at the rate of such salary so long as they are employed, and if the appropriation fails, then they must be dismissed in accordance with seniority rights."

The court reached the following conclusions with respect to the authority over position classification and fixing of compensation:

(1) That the Assembly has the power and duty to fix the salaries for classes and grades set up by the commission subject to right of veto by the governor as in case of other legislation; that it has no power to fix the salaries of individuals other than by class and grade; that in any case where the legislature has delegated such authority to the governor, the authority of the latter is equally limited to the fixing, approval or disapproval of salaries only by class and grade.

(2) That the Assembly has no authority to discriminate in regard to salaries between members of any class and grade as established by the commission.

(3) That the state treasurer is required to pay salaries as fixed by legislative enactment or by any agency duly authorized by such enactment as to class and grade as set up by the commission upon certification by the commission of appointment pursuant to law as required by the amendment.

(4) That salaries must be fixed according to class and grade as established by the Commission and the determination of equality of service rests in its discretion.

In the case of failure of the Assembly to appropriate sufficient funds for the account of any department for payment of the employees at the rate to which they are legally entitled, for a full biennium, the proper salary shall nevertheless be paid to all who are employed so long as funds are available and employees shall be dismissed, on failure of appropriation, in accordance with the Assembly's restrictions on its appropriation, and in order of seniority rights.

### Check-off of Union Dues

A recommendation lately made by the former Chairman of the War Labor Board, William H. Davis, now a member of the Board of Transportation of the City of New York, would permit dues of members of unions representing employees of the subway system to be deducted by the city and paid over to the union. The recommendation is coupled with the suggestion that this be done only if the individual employees consent thereto in writing, and provided the practice is found to be legal.

It may be recalled that the Maryland Court of Appeals in *Mugford v. Mayor of Baltimore* (see *Public Personnel Review*, April, 1946, p. 96) held that so long as the check-off of union dues was voluntarily accepted by the City and was based on each employee's written consent, that there was no legal impediment to such agreement between the city and the union.

A similar issue arose in the Supreme Court of Ohio (*Hagerman v. City of Dayton, et al*, 71

N. E. [2d] 246) where the court considered an ordinance authorizing the director of finance to make payroll deductions as requested by city employees for payment of dues to their union. The director sought a declaratory judgment to determine the validity of the ordinance. The Supreme Court held the ordinance authorizing a check off of union dues of city employees invalid because there is no authority for delegation by the municipality or by civil service appointees of any functions to any outside organization such as the union. The court pointed out that labor unions have no function which they may discharge in connection with civil service appointees. The court, construing general statutes which it deemed relevant to the issue, held deduction of such union dues from the city payrolls as violating the state statutes prohibiting assignment of wages except in case of agreement between employers and their employees in favor of a labor union involving check off of wages. The court held that a municipal corporation does not come within the meaning of the term "employer" as used in the general statutes, and that civil service appointees do not come within the definition of "employee" as used in such statutes.

Two pertinent extracts from the court's opinion are as follows:

There is no municipal purpose served by the check-off of wages of civil service employees. Counsel for appellees argue that a check-off is a convenience to both the municipal appointee and the labor union. We must be realistic and take judicial notice, or what is generally known that the check-off is a means of maintaining membership. Indeed, the record in this case shows that each so-called contract member is required to give a cognovit note for twenty months dues in advance and these proposed check-off payments are to be applied on such notes. The check-off is contrary to the spirit and purpose of the civil service laws of the state.

The laws of this state, the regulations of the civil service commissions, state and municipal, and the valid ordinances of the particular municipality cover fully all questions of wages, hours of work and conditions of employment affecting civil service appointees. Municipal civil service appointees are to be appraised and promotions are to be made in individual cases according to merit, fitness and seniority. There is no authority for the delegation either by the municipality of the civil service appointees of any functions to any organization of any kind. Each tub must stand on its bottom. The law provides for the election and appointment of officials whose duties would be interfered with by the intrusion of outside organizations. Nothing said herein is intended to limit free speech but it is intended to limit interference by organization with the duties of the duly elected and appointed officials.

### Position in Unclassified Service

As an aftermath of the case of *Deering v. Hirsch*, 65 N. E. (2d) 649, (see *Public Personnel Review*, July, 1946, p. 161) where it was held that the director of recreation in Cincinnati was in the classified service, the situation was sought to be corrected by abolishing the position and establishing a new position of superintendent of recreation. The civil service commission classified the position as in the unclassified service, supporting the Recreation Commission's view that the position of superintendent was a "secretary," "assistant," or "clerk" within the terms of a statute authorizing departments of the city to appoint two secretaries, assistants, or clerks without examinations.

The court held that tested by dictionary definitions of the terms "secretary," "assistant," or "clerk," the duties of the superintendent of recreation as defined in the ordinance creating the position are not inconsistent with the duties of a secretary, assistant or clerk. The court pointed out that the ordinance specifically provides that the superintendent of recreation shall be the secretary and administrative officer to assist the commission in the direction and development of organized recreational activities, and held, therefore, that it is "abundantly clear that he is both a secretary of and an assistant to the recreation commission" within the meaning of the statute permitting exceptions from the classified service. The court held further that the city could abolish the position of director of recreation and authorize the recreation commission to appoint a secretary or assistant under the title of superintendent of recreation. (*City of Cincinnati v. Urner, et al*, 70 N. E. [2d] 881.)

### Removal for Falsifying Application

An interesting case came before the Supreme Court of Illinois recently involving an attempt by the legislature to reinstate a policeman who was a war veteran and who had been dismissed from the Chicago city service for falsifying his age at the time he took the examination for patrolman. The civil service rules provided a maximum age of 27 for admission to the police force. In 1943, many years after his appointment, the veteran was dismissed on charges that he had misrepresented his age at the time of the examination. (His age was actually 37). In 1945, a special act was passed providing that "no person appointed in the classified civil service who is entitled to military preference . . . shall be removed or discharged because he misstated his age. Any such person so dis-



charged shall be immediately reinstated upon the taking effect of this amendatory act."

The court, of course, upheld the validity of preference in civil service appointments for veterans as valid class legislation, pointing out that preference for veterans in the civil service has long been recognized. However, class legislation which grants a particular class of veterans immunity "from the consequences of falsely stating his age on an application for examination" is invalid discrimination. The court could see no reasonable connection between the value of military training and exemption from the consequences of a fraudulent misstatement of age in order to procure a position. It believed that "rather than emulating and recognizing patriotic service for the public welfare," the amendment places a premium on violation of law. The court held the attempt of the general assembly not only sought to grant the veteran immunity from the consequences of his fraudulent act, but to secure for him a reinstatement in his position which he fraudulently obtained in the first place, as repugnant not only to the constitutional prohibition against discriminatory class legislation, but as "likewise repugnant to basic morality." (*Jendrick v. Allman*, 71 N. E. [2d] 44.)

(Editor's Note: Compare *Wolff v. Hodson*, 33 N. E. [2d] 90; and *Schrader v. Hodson*, 38 N. E. [2d] 110.)

### Liability for Recovery of Damages

Under the New York civil service law, where a veteran is refused preference in appointment as provided by the constitution and the civil service law, he has "a right of action . . . for damages and for righting the wrong." A war veteran who claimed that he had been damaged by the failure of the department head and the civil service commission to expedite his appointment to the police department, successfully brought a proceeding to compel his appointment. Thereafter he brought a suit to recover damages against the city and the public officials whom he alleged were responsible for the delay in his appointment. The court upheld his right to bring such a proceeding and to recover for such damages as he could prove resulted therefrom. (See *Public Personnel Review*, April, 1944, p. 109.)

Thereafter, the veteran brought an action to recover for loss of salary and other damages, including expenses incurred in litigation and for counsel fees paid by him. The trial court referred the matter to an official referee to determine the damages incurred by the veteran.

The referee awarded as judgment the salary of the position during the period the veteran was kept out of the position. He was allowed as part of his damages counsel fees of \$5,000 allegedly incurred in the earlier case seeking his appointment.

Upon appeal it was held that counsel fees incurred or paid by the veteran in obtaining his appointment through litigation could not be included as "damages." All he could recover was the amount of salary of the position to which he would have been entitled for the period when he would have been employed.

"While it is true," stated the court, "that in some jurisdictions a violation by a public officer of rights accorded to any civil service employee gives rise, even without a statute to that effect, to a tort action for damages, which include elements other than lost salary, and that liability attaches thereto though the act of the officer was in good faith and without malice, still no such rule of damages has ever prevailed in this state . . . It has never been the rule, except in limited classes of litigation, to allow as damages prior legal expense." (*Manko v. City of Buffalo*, 65 N. Y. S. [2d] 623; affd. 72 N. E. [2d] 623).

### Physical Examinations Upon Re-employment

Occasionally attempt is made by the personnel agency, either on its own initiative or inspired by an operating department, to reexamine employees as to their ability to continue in particular classes of employment requiring unique physical capacities. Some years ago the New York Civil Service Commission, at the behest of the Park Department, required that those serving as life guards at the city beaches be reexamined to determine their fitness to continue to perform the arduous duties of life guards. (*Rossi v. Moses*, 279 N. Y. 200.)

Recently, the California District Court of Appeals considered the validity of a rule of the civil service board of Long Beach which required that employees who had been absent from duty "for any reason" for six months or more be required to pass a physical examination upon return to their positions. A patrolman who had been serving on the city police force for a number of years, and upon taking a leave of absence had been advised by the police captain that he could return at any time within the six months period without taking any physical examination, sought to estop the commission from denying him reinstatement at the end of the six month leave of absence when he sought to return to work.

The patrolman had submitted a certificate of his physician which he filed with the city health officer to the effect that he "was sufficiently restored to health so as to be able to efficiently perform the duties of his position of patrolman in the police department." The commission's medical examiner, however, found upon his return that the patrolman was suffering from a heart ailment which incapacitated him for the proper performance of his duties. The city manager thereupon refused to reinstate the patrolman. The patrolman contended that the rule of the board was invalid in so far as it purported to require his reexamination as a condition precedent to his return to duty after an authorized leave of absence. It was further claimed that the civil service board had no authority to adopt any such rule which, it was alleged, was beyond the scope of the city charter provision; and particularly when the rule of the commission dealing with leaves of absence specifically provided that "the employee shall have the right at any time within the period of leave to return to work." The court upheld the board's determination notwithstanding that the police captain had assured the patrolman that his reinstatement would automatically follow when his leave of absence was terminated. The city could not be estopped from invoking the rule by the promise of any public official acting without compliance with the rule. (*English v. City of Long Beach*, 176 P. (2d) 940, Cal.)

### CASE NOTES

**Classification—Judicial Review.** The state civil service commission adopted a report of a legislative commission which provided a classification and compensation plan for state employees as required by statute. Reclassification of a position which results in the employee being placed in a position of lower grade, with a lower salary range, is not subject to review by the courts, even where the employee can show that other employees in the same department who held similar positions before reclassification were reclassified in higher positions without promotional examinations. The court would not substitute its judgment for that of the commission as to the classification and allocation of the state civil service employees, in the absence of a statute authorizing judicial review of the reclassification by the commission. (*Higgins v. Civil Service Commission*, 51 A. [2d] 261, N. J.)

**Classification—Classification of Court Clerk.** In a reclassification of a position of "assistant

chief clerk" in the Wayne County Circuit Court Commissioner's office, which was the employee's budgetary title, was reclassified as "Clerk 2." Neither his salary nor his duties were affected by such classification. The petitioner claimed that his position was that of a court clerk, fixed by statute, and therefore beyond the jurisdiction of the civil service commission to change by reclassification. The court upheld the reclassification by the commission holding that the position involved was not one in the state judicial system, but was a subordinate employment in an administrative agency, notwithstanding the peculiar title of the agency of "circuit court commissioner." The court found the position was not expressly excepted from the classified service, and was therefore subject to reclassification by the commission under the general provisions contained in the civil service act. (*Duncan v. Wayne County, et al*, 25 N. W. [2d] 605 Mich.)

**Pay—Firemen on Call.** Firemen have no rightful claim for pay for hours spent sleeping at the firehouse, even though they may stay there in order to be available for duty and "waiting to be engaged." The court held that they were not hired "to do nothing but wait for something to happen," and were required to be paid only for time actually spent on emergency calls during the sleeping shift of their 24-hour duty period at the firehouse. The U. S. Circuit Court of Appeals reversed a ruling of the lower court which had awarded over \$275,000 to 53 firemen of Elwood, Illinois, for time spent sleeping at the local ordinance plant fire station. (*Bell v. Porter C. C. A.* 7 [Kerner, C. J.] December 10, 1946.)

**Pay—Agreement to Restore Deductions.** A promise made to city employees of the Detroit Street Railway Department that certain deductions from their salaries in the form of "emergency contributions" would be repaid to the employees when funds became available was a matter for the jury to determine as to whether there had been an agreement by the city to make such repayments. It was held that the burden was on the city to establish that funds were available to repay the deductions, and if such funds were not available six years before the action was commenced the claims of the employees were outlawed. Whether the funds were then available was also a fact for the jury to determine (*Tumey et al v. City of Detroit, Department of Street Railways*, 25 N. W. [2d] 571, Mich.)

**Pay—Reduction in Rate.** Reduction in salary of an investigator, a war veteran in the district attorney's office, from \$4,000 to \$3,300, where other investigators were receiving only \$3,400 per year, did not constitute a "removal from office" under the civil service law. Such reduction in salary, even in the case of a war veteran, was held not to be discriminatory nor precluded by the civil service law, which provides that a veteran may not be reduced in rank or grade except in the same manner as in the case of dismissal from the service—that is, on charges after a hearing. It appears that the employee had been appointed a few months before a change of administration, and his salary after the change was reduced to the level of other employees holding similar positions. (*Gerard v. McDonald*, 66 N. Y. S. [2d] 882, Special Term.)

**Appointments—Discrimination.** An appointing authority may not fail to appoint in regular order of an eligible list because he wished to appoint women as temporary deputy inspectors, believing that women were better qualified to perform the duties of the position. The court held such reason not justifiable for passing over persons higher on the list. It held that department heads had no authority under the civil service statute to make appointments, arbitrarily, but must fill positions with eligibles certified in accordance with the civil service law and rules. It was further held that an eligible entitled to certification could compel termination of employment of temporary appointees; nor was it a valid defense that eligibles higher than the complainant on the list were absent in military service or in defense work and might lose right to certification ahead of the complainant if the latter were appointed in place of the temporary appointees. (*Caslin v. Geary, et al*, 71 N. E. [2d] 96, Ill.)

**Dual Employment—Compatibility.** A statute forbade an officer of the city to be interested in any contract with the city or do any business or "any work," or purchase supplies for use of the city. It was held that the statute does not prohibit a city clerk from acting as the city purchasing agent, with added pay for such services, since the word "work" in such statute refers to work normally done for the city by independent contractors, not by a city officer or employee. The court held the two positions of city clerk and city purchasing agent compatible where the person is employed to perform other services for the city which were incidental to his own work, and no interest adverse to the public

was involved. (*Raymond v. Bartlett, et al*, 175 P. [2d] 288, Cal.)

**Reinstatement—Right to Salary.** Where an employee has been retired for disability and later reinstated, he is entitled upon reinstatement to the same salary he received in the position he held when he was retired, according to the New York statute relating to reinstatements generally. Upon reinstatement he is entitled to all the salary privileges accorded to all other employees authorized to be reinstated under the civil service law. (*Stewart v. O'Dwyer*, 66 N. Y. S. [2d] 551, App. Div.)

**Promotion—Eligibility to Compete.** Where a statute provides that promotions shall be made by successive grades or ranks so far as practicable, the civil service commission may not authorize eligibility for other than those serving in the grade immediately below the grade or rank to be filled by promotion examination. Where the commission sought to permit twelve patrolmen in the police department to compete with six sergeants for a higher position, the court held the patrolmen not entitled to eligibility. Even where the petitioner had passed the examination and was placed at the head of the eligible list, he could not compel his promotion if he was not eligible to compete in the examination. (*Hinckley v. Cole, et al*, 71 N. E. [2d] 714, Ohio.)

**Veterans' Preference—Eligibility of Coast Guard Temporary Reserves.** The Court of Appeals of the District of Columbia has held that the federal Veteran Preference Act of 1944 includes among those who are entitled to civil service preferences temporary reservists in the United States Coast Guard. It was held that all members of the "armed forces" are by the terms of the Act entitled to the privileges granted thereunder. Inasmuch as the Coast Guard, which is normally a civilian agency under the Treasury Department, was made a part of the Navy during the war, it became part of the "armed forces." (*Cohen & Hubickey v. Mitchell*, 69 F. Supp., 54.)

**Lay-off—Lack of Funds.** Where a police force is reduced in order to keep the municipality's expenditures within the constitutional limitation, members of the force may be discharged without charges or a hearing; nor does it (in the absence of express statute) confer on the policemen thus discharged special preference in reinstatement when the positions are re-estab-

lished. Whether the positions are to be filled by reinstatement of those formerly discharged, or replaced by others, is within the discretion of the appointing authority. (*City of Tulsa v. Cockrell*, 176 P. [2d] 818 Oklahoma.)

**Veterans' Preference—Preference in Lay-off.** Two cases came before the federal courts recently involving construction of the federal Veteran Preference Act of 1944, and the reduction-in-force regulations of the United States Civil Service Commission as applied to separations of veterans and non-veterans from their federal positions. In one case it was held that where veterans had been reemployed pursuant to the Selective Service Act of 1940, which requires their reemployment for a period of at least one year, they were also entitled, where positions were thereafter abolished, to retention over non-veterans regardless of length of service or seniority rights of non-veterans. The court held that the veteran preference act granted privileges beyond the selective service act, and that the privileges accorded under the former law are exclusive of the privileges accorded under the Selective Service Act. *Kirkman v. MacMormand*, U. S. District Court, Eastern District Pa. 71 F. Supp. 15.)

In another case, *Hilton v. Forrestal*, (March 31, 1947), the U. S. District Court for the District of Columbia in a somewhat similar proceeding attacking the constitutionality of the Veteran Preference Act of 1944 in depriving non-veterans of seniority in force reductions, upheld the validity of the preferences in retention accorded to veterans over non-veterans.

**Workmen's Compensation—Definition of "State Employee."** A tuberculosis patient working as a student nurse in a state sanatorium without compensation other than remission of state university fees, board, and lodging, was held not to be a "state employee" entitled to workmen's compensation. There can be no relationship of employer and employee between the state and such person under an implied contract of hire, and the relationship of employer and employee is governed solely by the civil service law. (*State v. Industrial Commission*, 26 N. W. [2d] 273, Wis.)

**Unions—Membership Prohibition Upheld.** The city of Dallas adopted an ordinance prohibiting city employees from becoming members of a labor union. In an action brought by the CIO to enjoin its enforcement on the ground that it was unconstitutional in that it

deprived public employees of their civil liberties, including the right of assembly, freedom of speech, and freedom of the press, the court upheld the validity of the ordinance. (*CIO v. City of Dallas*, 198 S. W. [2d] 143, Texas.)

**Liability for Employee's Mental Incapacity.** The New York Court of Appeals reversed the determination of the Appellate Division in *McCrink v. City of New York* (see *Public Personnel Review*, October, 1946, p. 230), where the latter court held that the city was not liable for injury to a citizen by a policeman who had gone berserk, notwithstanding that the police commissioner had been aware that the policeman had become so addicted to an excessive use of alcohol that he had repeatedly been subject to disciplinary action, and where the City should have known that he might become a source of danger to the public. The Appellate Division had reversed a judgment in favor of the plaintiff against the City. The Court of Appeals held that under the New York statutes (waiving immunity from liability under its Court of Claims Act in the case of state or municipal corporations), where mere potentiality of injury exists, only such foresight as appears to be commensurate with its reasonably probable occurrence need be employed. It held further that it was a question of fact for the jury whether, in the circumstances disclosed by the record, the retention in police service of the particular policeman involved danger to others "reasonably to be foreseen." The court accordingly remanded the case for retrial. (*McCrink v. City of New York*, 71 N. E. [2d] 419; 296 N. Y. 99.)

## Discharge

**Judicial Review.** Again the New Jersey Supreme Court has held that in reviewing the dismissal of a policeman the court must review both the facts as well as the law. The court ordered the reinstatement of a policeman charged with intoxication because it was "convinced that the prosecutors did not preponderate in the proof of the charges," thus justifying the lower court in setting aside the policeman's conviction. The evidence revealed that the policeman had reported five minutes late for his tour. He was observed when he appeared at the police headquarters to have slouched over the rail; and when his eyes were detected blinking curiously he was ordered to await a medical examination to determine whether he was intoxicated. The medical examiner testified that the policeman talked incoherently, was un-



steady in his gait, that his eyes blinked and that he swayed when subjected to certain tests. The policeman's defense was that he had been suffering from fatigue due to working extra hours every day for a considerable length of time. The court appears to have been impressed with evidence that the patrolman walked without assistance from the police station to the hospital to undergo a blood test and back to the police station, and by the further point that if the medical examiner was satisfied that the patrolman was intoxicated, why the medical examiner deemed it necessary to subject him to a blood test. (*Kearins et al v. Ziegner, et al*, 50 A. [2d] 865 N. J.)

**Editor's Note:** In most jurisdictions the courts will not substitute their judgment for the removing authority where there is reasonable evidence to substantiate the charges.)

Expressing a different point of view, and one generally followed by the courts in reviewing dismissal of employees in the classified civil service, the Ohio Supreme Court held that in reviewing dismissal of a public employee it would not substitute the court's judgment or discretion for that of the civil service commission. (*State ex rel Neal v. State Civil Service Commission*, 72 N. E. [2d] 68, Ohio.)

The dismissal of a superintendent of the county home for dishonesty and malfeasance in submitting incorrect expense vouchers, which determination was affirmed on appeal by the state civil service commission, was upheld in a mandamus proceeding where the record showed no abuse of discretion or arbitrary or capricious action on the part of the department head or the commission. "The question is not what this court would have done had it been functioning in place of the respondents," stated the court, "but whether upon the facts before the respondent it acted arbitrarily, capriciously or without justification."

**Improper Procedure.** An employee was suspended without pay, but the procedure expressly provided by statute authorizing such suspension was not followed. He subsequently was removed on charges, which removal he challenged because he claimed the suspension was invalid. He was held to be entitled to reinstatement.

A police officer who under the civil service rules would be entitled to a hearing before a member of the civil service commission and to judicial review of dismissal from the service, had been suspended by the mayor without be-

ing given a hearing within 72 hours after notice of suspension, as provided by the civil service law. He had not been given a printed form stating his rights under the civil service law, as required by statute. Failure to comply with the strict provisions of the law which prohibited suspension exceeding a period of 72 hours except on charges after a hearing, as well as in cases of removal, was held fatal, and thus entitling the employee to reinstatement as a matter of law. (*Henderson v. Mayor of Medford*, 70 N. E. [2d] 712, Mass.)

**Appeal and Reinstatement.** The Connecticut merit system law provides for a personnel appeal board which may review dismissals from the classified service. It was held that the board has no jurisdiction to review dismissal of an employee not in the classified service. A decision of the personnel appeal board acting within the power conferred upon it is conclusive, however, where the merit system law makes no provision for appeal to the courts from the decision of the board. The court, however, may invoke its jurisdiction to determine whether the position comes within the jurisdiction of the appeals board as being within the "classified service." (*State ex rel Levy v. Pallotti*, 51 A. [2d] 136, Conn.)

## Retirement

**Retroactive Reinstatement Disallowed.** Where a fireman, for the purpose of obtaining a pension, sought to have his alleged illegal suspension and removal from the service set aside *nunc pro tunc* as of the date of his dismissal fifteen years ago, he was held to be guilty of gross neglect or laches, and not entitled to any relief from the pension fund; this notwithstanding that during all the time since his suspension he had made demands for his reinstatement and had been promised continuously from time to time that the matter would be taken care of. (*City of Indianapolis et al v. State ex rel Kennedy*, 70 N. E. [2d] 635, Ind.)

**Inavailability of Sufficient Funds for Pension.** Where funds for the payment of pensions become insufficient to meet the city's pension obligations, the remedy is not an exclusion of one class of beneficiaries as against another by strained interpretation of the statute, but through proper legislation either making additional funds available or determining what if any class of pensioners shall have priority of payment. All funds received by the trustees of the police pension fund from any source,



whether taxes, disciplinary fines, or sale of unclaimed property, may be used to meet pension claims. (*Stark v. Schneider, et al*, 72 N. E. [2d] 118, Ohio.)

*Application of Minimum Retirement Age.* A statute which provides for retirement of firemen at age 70 was construed as not compelling the retirement of a fireman who had not been a member of the retirement system. He may not be dismissed from the department under the guise of retirement upon reaching age 70 unless he were a beneficiary of the fund. The option to retire at age 70 is not tantamount to compulsory retirement at age 70, particularly where the statute does not expressly provide for mandatory retirement at such age. (*Travers et al v. Fogarty, et al*, 50 A. [2d] 238, Md.)

*Provisional Appointee Entitled to Pension.* The Cleveland charter provides that a member of the police force may be retired on a pension after serving 25 years, provided he is holding at the time of retirement a position as a result of having passed a competitive civil service examination. The petitioner had not served 25 years in the competitive class. He had served for a considerable period of time as a provisional or temporary appointee. He claimed that the time he served as a provisional appointee must be computed in measuring the 25 years of service. It appears also that the two terms of service, provisional and permanent, were not continuous, but were rendered at different periods of time, though his total length of service in the police department was 25 years. The court held that he was entitled to retirement, holding that the nature of employment, whether temporary or permanent, was not determinative of the right to a pension, but solely length of actual service in the department. (*Boyd v. Schneider, et al*, 70 N. E. [2d] Ohio.)

*Election of Pension System.* A state law authorizing political subdivisions of the state having their own retirement system to "elect" to

adopt the state retirement system for its own pension requirements. It was held that the term "elect" in the statute meant a choice between adoption and rejection of the state system; not a choice between adopting the state system and rejecting an existing plan or discontinuing an existing plan. A retirement system for a municipal water works operating under its own retirement plan could therefore choose to continue its plan and at the same time participate in the state retirement system, if it so chooses. (*Independent School District of Cedar Rapids v. Iowa Employment Security Commission, et al*, 25 N. W. [2d] 491, Iowa.)

*Proximate Cause of Disability.* Where evidence sustains a finding that physical strain or over-exertion in the work of a fireman aggravated a pre-existing heart affliction compelling the fireman to retire and death ensues, the estate of the fireman is entitled to recover a disability pension "by reason of bodily injury received in the performance of the employee's duty" for the period between his retirement and the date of his death. Incidentally, it was held that a report of a physician who had not personally examined the deceased, which report purported to be only a medical history of the deceased's case, and the doctor's findings mere conclusions therefrom, was not competent evidence but merely hearsay. (*Kinney v. Sacramento City Employees' Retirement System, et al*, 176 P. [2d] 775.)

*Determination of Amount of Pension.* A statute provided for retirement of members of the police and fire department amounting to one-half of the annual pay at the time of retirement. In the case of a member of the police department who had been a clerk, but who had been assigned as acting chief of police for 22 days just prior to his retirement, it was held that he was entitled to be retired only on the basis of his salary received as a clerk before his retirement, and not on the salary of acting chief of police. (*Smith v. Board of Trustees, etc. of Des Moines*, 25 N. W. [2d] 858, Iowa.)



**Measuring and Rating Employee Value.** John B. Probst. The Ronald Press Company. New York. 1947. 166 pp. \$5.00.

Persons interested in the Probst service rating system and the scoring technique involved will find this text interesting. Avowedly written "to meet the needs of those who are in search of thoroughly organized and time-tested methods for correctly rating the principle capabilities and work performances of their individual employees," most of the book is devoted to the author's own service report forms. The first four chapters, in order, deal with purposes and types of rating plans, provide a general critique, and focus attention on the need for development.

All of this is accomplished concisely as Part One of the book labeled "Employee Rating Plans in General." Most of the criteria listed as goals of development of a "good" system are those commonly accepted. Some would take issue, however, with the theory that service rating scores for a select group should adhere to a normal distribution. Perhaps more disagreement would be manifested with the recommendation that the rating officer be permitted to select the traits to be checked. On this the author argues that the officer might not be sufficiently familiar with the service value of an employee to check all traits listed. Others have argued that the requirement that all traits be checked compels the officer to acquire the necessary familiarity with the employee's service.

Part Two, labeled "An Improved Rating System," starts out with a chapter headed "Development of a More Effective Rating System." This and subsequent chapters do not, as one might infer, deal with ways and means, but narrows down to a discussion of the Probst system. A chapter on statistical analyses of ratings, for example, consists largely of distributions of scores attained in rating various occupational groups, although some of the elementary statistical measures are defined and illustrated.

Part Three, "The System in Practice," continues primarily with the application of the Probst system to special problems, such as oral interviews and filling supervisory positions, and concludes with an enumeration of experiments requiring further research.

Appendices include an outline covering the

origin and development of the special scoring stencils and formula scales used in translating numerical scores into letter ratings; a section generally outlining the procedures utilized in selecting the traits or items comprising the Probst report; a chart showing a distribution of ratings compared with a normal distribution and a summary distribution; a discussion of a system for determining order of layoff by a combination of Probst ratings and seniority; a group of foreign translations of the Probst form including Chinese, Hungarian, and Arabic; a summary distribution of ratings on interviews obtained from the Probst interview form; a non-technical analysis of interview ratings; a general statement on a test of the rating form in England; and a set of directions for conducting an experiment in service ratings.

Although both text and appendices emphasize that words carry different meanings to different reporting officers, no direct explanation substantiating the use of single words or phrases is developed, except that the pragmatic one that the report form as constructed works. In fact, the word "lazy" (the first item on the report) is indicated as a shock word which, as such, apparently conveys the same meaning to all reporting supervisors and accordingly leads them to consider carefully all subsequent items. Basic problems of semantics and control in terms of trait definitions and training of reporting supervisors are barely covered. In one place the statement is made that "overall judgment, unaided, is highly unreliable and seriously lacking in validity." Later on, the description of the procedures of validation includes overall ratings as the principal criterion.

The author concludes that successive ratings of the same group of employees will reveal a tendency toward higher ratings because supervisors become accustomed to a higher standard of performance and thus visualize a higher type of worker as their "average" employee. More cynical observers of rating systems could attribute the phenomenon to a less ideal cause, such as lack of training of the supervisors, or perhaps lack of courage.

Scattered throughout the book are conclusions borne of experience that are of general application and worth noting, but they must be sought by the reader among the plethora of statements on the Probst system.

Enough credit may never be given the author for his contribution in the initiation and development of the check-list type of rating system. Observation of the reviewer has led him to the conclusion that the check-list approach offers more than any of the other types. However, in a text entitled as this one is, more precise statistical substantiation and more thorough documentation with fewer personal inferences would reflect more credit to the rating system and add materially to the stature of this book.—CHARLES A. MEYER, *Detroit Civil Service Commission*.

**Selective Job Placement.** Tobias Wagner. National Conservation Bureau, 60 John St., New York, 1946. 151 pp. \$2.50.

The title of this book gives one little reason to suspect that the contents deal almost entirely with the orthopedically disabled in industry. The author, through case studies made in industrial plants, makes comparisons of disabled workers with non-disabled workers relative to work efficiency as it is affected by experience, type of job, accident frequency and severity, age, and sex. Throughout the seven chapters, the fact is stressed that if the handicapped person is properly placed, his work results as to rate and quality of production, as well as earned wages, in almost every instance exceeds those of the normal worker. Inasmuch as comparisons proving that handicapped workers make excellent employees comprise a good portion of the volume, and while there is no reason to assume that the author in his official capacity did not have unlimited case samplings, it seems to the reviewer that one of this book's weaknesses is that no indication is given as to the number of industries or workers involved in any of the studies.

Chapter 1 relates to the proper placement of the worker: synchronization of the assets of the individual with the demands of the job, the judicious matching of the physical, educational and other requirements of the job with what the worker has to offer. Thus, when the disabled worker is properly placed, when the disability does not affect the efficient performance of a particular job, and when the worker had the necessary skills, knowledge, etc., the disabled worker is more efficient than the non-disabled. When improperly placed, however, he is less efficient than the non-disabled. The author also discusses the various psychological factors which should be considered before placing a candidate on a specific job. Much of this chapter is appropriate reading for any place-

ment officer, whether he is dealing with the handicapped or not.

Chapter 2 is a discussion of a "well-rounded selective placement program," which includes the following techniques: (1) Job demands and physical demands analysis, (2) interviewing the applicant, (3) determination of the applicant's physical capabilities, (4) placement, (5) training, and (6) follow-up. Sample charts and forms show how physical demands analyses are matched with job specifications. Two co-related forms are used, one known as the "Physical Capabilities Analysis," is filled out by the plant physician in making the medical examination of the applicant. This form is then compared with the second form, "Job Requirement Analysis," showing the requirements of the various jobs. Proper placement of the disabled requires that capabilities and requirements match.

The author's discussion of recruitment is comprehensive and practical, and offers several fresh viewpoints on desirable, but all too seldom used, techniques. In covering the subject of "Vocational Tests and Examinations," however, he is not so practical, for he delves into the realm of theory when he states "When they (tests) are effective, they should reveal an applicant's aptitudes, skills, knowledge, traits, safety attitudes, alertness and work habits, and should determine whether he can perform a job of uniform or non-uniform processes." Follow-up in the placement of disabled workers is important due to the fact that improper placement may aggravate the disability, affect productive ability, or involve demands beyond the worker's ability.

The primary purpose of the volume in probably covered in Chapter 3, "The Comparative Efficiency of the Normal and the Physically Exceptional Worker," although again this is not indicated by the title. The subject matter, aside from defining various terms used, is entirely devoted to statistical comparisons of work efficiency between the normal and the disabled worker. While the nature of the disabilities is in no case revealed, all studies were made on the premise that comparisons were made between groups of paired disabled and normal workers, one individual in each pair possessing a disability and the other being normal, and both being more or less comparable with respect to age, sex, experience, training and the job being performed. Comparative studies were made relative to the following categories: Influence of placement, accident frequency, absenteeism, relationship of previous work to production efficiency and length of time on the job, influence

of duration or cause of disability, influence of the type of job on work efficiency, influence of training, efficiency of female disables, family responsibility and age. Several pages are devoted to the author's conclusions.

Almost without exception it is shown that the work efficiency of the disabled is superior to that of the normal. The reviewer was much interested in the findings on age, which would indicate that contrary to popular opinion, all workers are about as efficient between the ages of 45-59 as those between the ages of 30-44. Also interesting was the fact that the 60-74 disabled age group were more efficient than the normals in the 45-59 age bracket, as well as in the 15-29 years category.

Chapter 4, in general, covers the history and principles of the development of industrial rehabilitation. Findings from other studies and insurance companies are included in this chapter. Chapter 5, consisting of thirteen pages, defines in laymen's language the more common orthopedic, visual, hearing and other disabilities. Also briefly discussed are types of mental illnesses.

Chapter 6, "Observations Concerning the Disabled Industrial Worker," treats with the psychological aspects, readjustment, wants and motivations, and mental attitudes of the disabled worker. Several pages of interviews or case histories of these workers are given. Practical pointers on placing certain types of disabled in industrial jobs conclude the chapter. This chapter gives a realistic and intimate picture of the problems confronting the handicapped.

Chapter 7 is designed to call attention to those responsible for the placement of personnel to the importance of considering selective placement as an integral part of economical industrial procedure. The author restates the various advantages of planning for personnel efficiency, and particularly as it applies to disabled workers.—FOSTER ROSER, *Flint Civil Service Commission*.

**The Social System of the Modern Factory—The Strike: A Social Analysis.** W. Lloyd Warner and J. O. Low. Yale University Press, New Haven, Conn. 1947. 247 pp. \$3.00.

Why do workers strike? The answer is the particular quest of this volume. The technique used to get the answer is that of the social anthropologist; only this time, instead of savage tribes or ancient primitives, the technique is applied to a modern industrial community and the workers employed in its chief industry, the

manufacture of shoes. The results of these painstaking research efforts are revealing.

The efforts are truly painstaking. A score of field workers, analysts, and writers worked intermittently from 1930 to 1945, collecting, analyzing, checking, and interpreting data in this medium sized, New England city. Biographies and case studies of hundreds of individuals and histories of scores of corporations and other institutions were compiled. An analysis was also made of 70,000 memberships in the various associations of the community, on the basis of a six-division, social-status scale. The results justify the efforts, too, most readers will agree.

This volume is number four in a series of six. Those already published are *The Social Life of a Modern Community*, by W. Lloyd Warner and Paul S. Lunt; *The Status System of the Modern Community*, by the same two authors; and *The Social Systems of American Ethnic Groups*, by W. Lloyd Warner and Leo Srole. In other words, a thorough-going analysis of the community preceded this present study. There will be two more volumes in this series: *American Symbol Systems*, and *Data Book for the Yankee City Series*. Your reviewer is no anthropologist, but it is his conviction that this "Yankee City" (pseudonym for the city studied) series should be ranked high on the list of this generation's social researches, along with the work of the Harvard group led by Mayo and Roethlisberger, describing the Western Electric Company and other experiments. Indeed it is closely related, as the authors indicate in their acknowledgments.

But now, back to the authors' social analysis of a strike in Yankee City. . . .

On a cold March day in the worst year of the depression, all the workers in all the factories of the principal industry of Yankee City walked out. They struck with little or no warning; struck with such impact that all the factories closed and no worker remained at his bench. Management had said their workers would never strike. . . . Union men outside the city said the Yankee City workers would not strike. . . . Many of the workers themselves had told us there would be no strike. Most of the townspeople . . . said Yankee City workers would never strike. But . . . the whole heterogeneous mass of workers left their benches and in a few hours wiped out most of the basic production from which Yankee City earned its living. Not only did they strike and soundly defeat management, but they organized themselves, joined an industrial union, and became some of its strongest members.

When suddenly, unexpectedly and contrary to all predictions, early in 1933, an open-shop industry in an open-shop town was struck, its workers unionized and the strike won, it was



indeed a providential opportunity to find out why in scientific detail.

Why? Economics? Yes, economic factors were of prime importance. It was the depth of the depression. Wages in the shoe factories had been cut in half, with work available only a few hours a week at that. Local philanthropy was exhausted; federal relief had not yet begun; actual starvation was a real threat, and fear of it was acute. But the depression was simply the setting. There were deeper and, for the long run, more important reasons. Here were some:

(1). The frustration and insecurity felt by the shoe factory worker, who had been reared on the "American Dream" of working his way up to the top on the basis of equal competition among equal men, only to find that (a) his economic status was worsening rather than improving; (b) he and his family were sinking lower in the social scale; (c) he was deprived of his historic skills, and even cut off from learning any by increasing mechanization of the industry and by ever-more-minute division of labor; and (d) the traditional apprentice-journeyman-master craftsman route of rising vocationally was not only ended by the machine, but the worker, as a mere machine operator, could never hope to show his ability as a supervisor in the way the old-style master shoemaker did; he was stymied.

(2). The consequent resentment by the worker against the supervisor and the manager; his loss of confidence in these "leaders," in fact blaming them (in the old days the most admired and highly respected men in the community) for the whole mess things were in, even blaming locally reared managers of locally owned shoe factories.

(3). The even greater hatred the workers felt for the "foreigners," the absentee owners who had by the time of the strike taken over ownership and management of most of the shoe industry, and who, because of their absence-status, were beyond the control and influence of the worker himself and even of his community; increased by the knowledge that any shoe factory could pick up and move—since both machinery and buildings were leased and not owned—at the mere whim of the owners, or be closed up completely, since the owning group also had many shoe factories in other cities to which production could be shifted.

(4). The consequent withdrawal of the worker socially, politically, and ecclesiastically from the community as a whole.

(5). The substitution of an increasing dependency on his own fellow-worker group, especially the union, for social expression.

The foregoing recapitulation does not begin to do justice to the compactly filled two hundred pages of the text, not to mention the six appendices which are full of interesting data. For example, Appendix Three, "Frequency of Membership of the Workers," contains a chart on political participation, showing that such participation decreases with social status. The shoe factory workers, being low scale socially, participated politically less than the adult population of the city as a whole. (Question: If these shoe operatives are representative of industrial workers elsewhere, may we not have here a profound explanation why, in America generally there is less and less participation as time goes on, in the processes of democratic government? With what will such withdrawal end?)

There are other specific points which will be of particular interest to the public personnel worker. Among them are the following:

(1). The technique employed in the research, and especially the searching below the conscious level into the real reasons for worker anxieties and explosions such as strikes. (Question: Does anybody know any ordinance, or even a statute, which will stop an explosion?)

(2). The detailed, humanly sophisticated, "natural history" account of how this one strike happened, how the workers were unionized, and how the strike was won (a story which ought to be required reading this year for every Congressman and legislator in these United States).

(3). The persistent misunderstanding between workers and supervisors, arising in large part because each possessed an ideology differing from the other, and the failure to take that difference into account.

(4). The unrest that an inequitable wage scale can cause when management takes the road of least resistance over a period of time.

(5). How important to the worker can be such under-rated devices as parades, mass-meetings, speeches, entertainments, and workers committees—not to mention labor unions themselves.

(6). How important the feeling is to the worker that he can rise into the supervisory hierarchy, and by ability and effort raise himself and his family in the social scale.

(7). How deep certain much-deplored prejudices are in American workers—against women, outsiders, "foreigners," and managers, and, for natives, residents of their own community, their own sex, and fellow workers—inconsistent though these predilections may be.



(8). The fact that large-scale organization—vertically in the form of the greatly elongated hierarchy from bottom to top, and horizontally in the form of regional, national and even international associations of like interests (manufacturers, labor unions)—in and of itself oppresses the worker as a threat to his security, which he is impotent to control either directly or through his community.

(9). The failure of management to anticipate these variously expressed social needs of the workers.

Yes, the strike in Yankee City taught many lessons. They are all there for us to learn.—HENRY REINING, JR., *University of Southern California*.

**Elements of Public Administration.** Fritz Morstein Marx, Ed. Prentice-Hall, Inc., New York, 1946. 637 pp. \$6.65.

A product of the let's-all-write-a-book school of authorship, this book to which fourteen men contributed proposes, according to the editor, to present "a unified and systematic treatment of the subject rather than a symposium made up of unconnected essays." Its principal aim "is to deepen the reader's understanding of the administrative process as an integral phase of contemporary civilization," and the publisher has made clear that the readers at which the book is aimed include students in college courses in public administration. Thus, what we have here is intended as a treatise on public administration which is useable as a college text.

The authors are a rather distinguished group in the field of public administration. Without exception they are products of university training in political science and public administration who have held moderately to highly responsible positions in the public service. Many have, in addition, held important consultant positions to governments, and many now hold important faculty positions in American colleges and universities. Most of their names will be familiar to anyone who has followed the literature of public administration or attended the assemblies of public administrators. Their names and their contributions to this volume are as follows; James W. Fesler, independent regulatory establishments and field organization; George A. Graham, ethical and practical aspects of the concept of responsibility; V. O. Key, Jr., government-owned corporations and legislative-administrative relations; Avery Leiserson, a view of the history and present status of the study of administration, interest groups in administration, and administrative

policy making; Milton M. Mandell, personnel administration; Harvey C. Mansfield, a contribution to the study of informal organization, and budgetary and auditing considerations; John D. Millett, administrative planning, and doctrines of organization; Fritz Morstein Marx, public administration in the "service state," departmental administration, informal organization, and middle management, in addition to the chores of editing; Don K. Price, "democratic administration," and administrative rule-making and adjudication; Henry Reining, Jr., middle-management, and work supervision; Wallace S. Sayre, employee motivation and participation; Donald C. Stone, practice of administrative analysis; John A. Vieg, an introductory chapter, a defense of administration, and the roles of a chief executive; and Dwight Waldo, administrative procedures.

Was the objective of preparing a unified and systematic treatise realized? To this reader, it seems that that goal was missed somewhere in the process. Structurally the book sounds logical enough: an introductory section, a section on organization and management, a variety of chapters assembled under the heading of "working methods," and a section on accountability. Yet the mixture does not gel.

The evidence is found in the frequent overlapping and interlapping of the chapters. They may say that they planned it that way, but repetition of the same ideas, sometimes using the same illustrations, seems to suggest authors unwilling to restrain themselves and an editor unwilling to delete the repetitive or immaterial. If the authors of the Chapters 1, 3, 4, and 5 had different assignments it is hardly apparent in the texts, for almost any one of the chapters would have sufficed to make the points all of them make. Further, the work is uneven in quality and particularly in the level of sophistication to which it is addressed. The editor was apparently unwilling to say to several of the authors: "You haven't thought hard enough. Better try again;" or "You have let your love of neat phrases overcome the necessity for systematic exposition;" or "You have told us a good deal about how one conspires in administration, but not very much about the techniques or theories of administrative analysis." Some chapters, such as John Vieg's admirable one on the chief executive, would be valuable additions to any elementary text in political science, while others such as Wallace Sayre's on morale and discipline and George Graham's on responsibility (each a superior job) probably assume more erudition and comprehension of institutional affairs than most undergraduates have.

Regardless of these reservations, the values of the book are still substantial. When some of the best trained men in the field of public administration spend several years on the inside of the federal administrative system and then write on administrative topics, readers should expect some realism in description and many valuable insights into the operations of large scale organizations. In nearly every chapter there are values of this sort which readers will prize.

Authors in a few instances have provided outstanding statements on administrative situations. James Fesler's chapter on field organization appears to be the best brief statement available anywhere on the considerations affecting administration in a field service. This chapter combines adequate institutional history with quite plausible expositions with regard to the conditions under which one and another thing will likely happen in a field organization. Avery Leiserson and Harvey Mansfield also prepared excellent chapters on their respective specialties, interest and representation, and fiscal administration. Key's chapter on legislative-administrative relations is an excellently realistic exposition of the influences operating in this milieu. The chapter on administrative procedures by Dwight Waldo, and the one on informal organization by Harvey Mansfield and Fritz Morstein Marx, are perhaps the more successful among the attempts to bring new materials to such a text.

Thus, from this reader's point of view, we have here not a treatise, but a collection of related essays with numerous high spots. These

high spots will justify the book to many readers. The book further has significance for its many instances of fervent defense of administration (especially federal) as a creative, productive part of modern life. Persons in search for materials in this vein will never lack for a reference.

Readers of *Public Personnel Review* may be particularly interested in the treatment of personnel administration in this volume. As in the case of financial administration, only one chapter is devoted solely to the topic. Milton Mandel, author of the chapter, is respectful of the reformist tradition in the personnel field, but directs himself particularly to the problems of personnel services for operating agencies. Considering the brief space devoted to the topic, the chapter is a remarkably complete view of modern personnel programs.

The unique thing about the book, however, from the point of view of the personnel specialty, is that almost no chapter is free of considerations relative to personnel. The influence of patronage policies, the possibilities of an administrative class, the possibility of impartiality on policy matters, considerations with regard to training and placement, results of characteristics of individuals in administrative posts, the issues of employee motivation and democracy within administration—these and other related matters are found throughout the book. Rather than a neglect of the personnel field, the book implicitly suggests its recognition as a principal concern of administration. KARL A. BOSWORTH, *Western Reserve University*.

## Personnel Administration—General

Aronson, Albert H. A postwar personnel perspective. *Public Welfare* 5 (2) February, 1947: 36-39.—The postwar period affords an opportunity for the full restoration of merit principles to peacetime operations, many of which were modified during the war. Public assistance agencies realize that effectively operating merit systems contribute, not only negatively by excluding unqualified personnel, but positively by helping to build a sound career system. Where state and county relations are involved, recruitment on a state-wide basis and provision for transfer and promotion across county lines and to the state staff are necessary for a sound career system. Inadequate compensation is still the major personnel problem of public welfare agencies, affecting recruitment of qualified personnel and increasing staff turnover. Although pay is a major problem, poor supervision, lack of security or promotional prospects, and other morale factors may cause excessive turnover. Employee evaluation is a continuing part of supervision and whether recorded or not, it is the basis for promotions, salary advancements, and other personnel actions. The effectiveness of a service rating system depends upon the quality of supervision and the development of performance standards. Increasing attention to the relationship between employment conditions and employee morale is being given by public welfare agencies, and the advantages of working in agencies with progressive practices in this regard may offset salary differentials. A sound retirement system, in addition to removing superannuated employees and providing them some security, promotes morale by increasing promotional opportunities for younger employees and lessening the contrast between the better type of private employment and governmental employment. In examinations, the problems have been mainly in recruitment. The better type of written tests have given a valid measure of intellectual abilities and knowledge in relevant occupational fields, although the rating of training and experience and the oral examination have not reached the same degree of validity. The latter, however, are the best available measures of personality factors suitable to public employment. The key problem in merit system administration is recruitment. To meet the short-term problems of recruitment, all sources of possible candidates must be

contacted. The long-term recruitment problem calls for changing public attitudes toward public employment in public welfare work. There is need for a cooperative planned approach on the part of the merit system agency and the operating agencies to the interpretation of the work of the operating agencies and of the opportunity it affords for satisfying public service.  
—Grace M. Pierson.

Rutledge, Donald A. Civilian personnel administration in the War Department. *Public Administration Review* 7 (1) Winter, 1947: 49-59.—The program of civilian personnel management in the War Department which evolved from the wartime emergency was characterized not only by its utilization of the full range of personnel techniques, but also by the greatest decentralization of personnel authority in the history of the federal service. The story of decentralization, both in its effect on the development of personnel administration at the field installation level and in the organizational provisions for the planning and control of the decentralized program, is believed to be of especial interest at this time because of the apparently growing trend in the federal service toward decentralization of administrative decisions to the field level. Beginning in December, 1940, authority was delegated from the bureaus of the War Department to their field establishments to permit them to utilize the full services of the nineteen newly established civilian personnel field offices. In August, 1942, the Secretary of War announced the program of complete decentralization of personnel authority to the lowest practicable operating echelon. The field installations were given authority to effect appointments, promotions, transfers, and separations, to classify graded and ungraded positions, carry on necessary training programs, develop effective employee relations programs, handle grievance and disciplinary actions, operate suggestion systems, and carry on other personnel functions with a minimum of reference to higher authority. Actions, of course, had to comply with basic laws, regulations, standards, and policies, and were subject to post-audit review, but the decision to act on individual cases rested with the installations. A high-pressure promotional campaign to convince field officials of the importance of the personnel function resulted in the remarkable record of con-

verting in less than a year from a record-keeping personnel job to a positive program with well-developed techniques. Because it became necessary to assure the adequacy of the field programs and their compliance with all departmental requirements, the department engaged in another pioneering effort by installing a program of complete audit and inspection of the personnel function.—*William Brody.*

### Classification; Pay

Baruch, Ismar. *Pay for stand-by duty. Personnel Administration* 9 (3) January, 1947: 27-31.—The general overtime pay provision for federal employees made effective in 1945 presented the problem of computing compensation for stand-by duty in excess of forty hours a week. What policy and method could be applied for figuring overtime pay for jobs which require an employee to remain on duty continuously for long periods of time, but which do not require continuous mental or physical exertion during that time? In 1942, a temporary wartime overtime pay statute provided that stand-by employees be paid ten per cent additional compensation in lieu of overtime pay. In 1943, departments were granted an optional authority to consider stand-by workers as being on full-time duty. Therefore overtime could be figured on the basis of an administrative work week decided by the department head. In 1945, the civil service commission decided to apply the same pay principles as those applied to stand-by duty in private industry. An amended regulation provided that the hours per week should be computed by subtracting from the total number of hours of duty scheduled per week the number of hours allowed by regulation for sleeping and eating. This is the pay policy of the Department of Labor, established under the Fair Labor Standards Act of 1938 for stand-by duty in private industry. This overtime principle has been affirmed by two U. S. Supreme Court rulings in 1944: *Armour and Company v. Wantock*, and *Skidmore v. Swift and Company*. The handling of pay for stand-by duty through administration of the classification or basic salary plan is precluded by the Classification Act of 1923.—*Marvin Iverson.*

Mayhew, Rodney D. *Job evaluation by block ranking. Modern Management* 7 (1) January, 1947: 13-16.—Block ranking is an effective way of enabling various persons to arrive at similar conclusions regarding the degree of each factor required for a particular job. With this method, each factor is divided into two variable sub-

factors. One variable of a factor, separated into segments according to degrees of importance, forms the horizontal scale of a form consisting of squares or "blocks;" the other variable, similarly, forms the vertical scale—each factor requiring a separate "block" form. For instance, the factor of "Manipulative Skill" consists of the variables "Precision" and "Dexterity." Using the usual concepts of "key jobs," these are written into the form, each job occupying the block or square which reflects its evaluation in terms of the factor's two variables. When key jobs have been written in on all factor forms, all other jobs are ranked accordingly. Conversion of the ranking results to wage figures may be accomplished by applying some standard technique of either factor comparison or point rating. Block ranking, therefore, is a method of picturing a job in relation to other jobs, and serves as a means of facilitating the use of various kinds of job evaluation systems that utilize factors in analyzing jobs. (Article contains illustrations of block form and sample schedules of rates for key jobs.)—*John C. Crowley.*

Sufirin, Sidney C. *An economist looks at job evaluation. Personnel* 23 (5) March, 1947: 302-09.—Job evaluation is worth while. Without this orderly method for determining the duties of its jobs, an organization has to use guesswork in determining what wages to pay. Job evaluation provides information on the comparability of jobs in different plants and therefore offers a rational basis for differences or similarities in wage rates in different plants. Despite comparability of jobs in different plants, however, a plant may deliberately set higher wage rates to maintain harmonious labor relations, reduce labor turnover, escape higher tax brackets, or obtain the best available employees. There is a fallacy of simplicity in job evaluation, namely, attempting to fit a straight line trend to data which do not follow this relationship. This may result in some jobs being underpaid or overpaid. Insufficient data, and arbitrary interpolation and extrapolation also affect job evaluation adversely. A fallacy of job evaluation, symmetry, results in a provision for an equal number of wage steps within each wage class, or an arbitrary distribution of persons within each wage classification. This may result in a neat diagram but unworkable procedures when changes in business activity occur. A precaution that should be observed in job evaluation or employee evaluation is to use only factors which determine productivity. Appearance and per-



sonality and other similar factors have little or no bearing on the value of the employee.—*Milton Mandell.*

### Recruitment; Selection; Induction

Steinmetz, Harry C. **Selecting personnel workers.** *Educational and Psychological Measurement* 7 (1) Spring, 1947: 37-43.—In the face of common recognition of functional variability of personnel workers from executives and technicians to timekeepers, there has been an incongruous neglect in seeking objective evidences of personnel abilities and developing performance tests of ability. In the interest of understanding fitness for personnel work, study should be made of all who are successful or unsuccessful in similar circumstances and under similar requirements. To stimulate empirical study, four criteria are suggested. One is the individual's record of having adjusted others. The second is his standing among associates, calling for a three-way rating by coordinate associates, subordinates, and supervisors. The third criterion is knowledge useful for the position. The fourth, novel but promising, criterion is insight into others in terms of prediction of responses. It would be a measure of psychological understanding, which might be derived from relative ability to score high or low in a personality test following special instructions. For example, the Guilford Martin "Inventory of Factors GAMIN" is now being administered experimentally, first naively, followed by ratings of self and others and of certain knowledge categories, then with instructions to answer as persons X or Y, and, finally, for instance, to appear maximally dominant-masculine-composed. What is sought is ability to predict the scoring key, on the thesis that here, the proof of knowledge is prediction, and that an element of prognosis is present in every diagnosis. Psychological insight is practically meaningful only insofar as it is evinced in tests of ability to duplicate or predict responses of individuals or groups. Measurement of insight, evidenced by prediction of behavior is measurable, useful and worthy of analysis, perhaps with psychological and personnel associations as sponsors.—*Miriam A. Margolies.*

Strong, Edward K., Jr. **Differences in interests among public administrators.** *Journal of Applied Psychology* 31 (1) February, 1947: 18-38.—In training, testing, and promoting public administrators, it is useful to know that they are a heterogeneous group of men, certain sub-groups of which are very similar and certain sub-groups

of which differ greatly from one another in their interests. They score high and very much alike on the public administrator and OL interest scales, but, on the whole, score very low on other occupational interest scales. Vocational Interest Blanks from 550 successful public administrators selected by the Committee on Public Administration of the Social Science Research Council were divided into sixteen sub-groups on the basis of function pursued and scored on 34 occupational interest scales. An analysis of their interests was then made on the basis of the 34 mean scores for each of the sub-groups. The highest mean scores were on personnel, production manager, and lawyer interest, and these scores were high enough to indicate only probable interest. Based on the averages for all, a public administrator obtains three and a half ratings high enough to indicate interest in the occupation. This low average is caused by difference in interests among the administrators; for interests are related to activities, and if the interests of men engaged in a wide variety of activities are averaged, the resultant compensation makes low scores inevitable. The five sub-groups of hospital superintendent, prison warden, personnel, welfare, and federal administrators do not differ significantly on any of the interests. The six sub-groups of engineer, chemist-physicist, statistician, city manager, public health, and forest service supervisor differ from the above five in having stronger scientific production and mechanical interests and weaker social service, public accounting, clerical, and sales interests. The remaining four sub-groups of taxation, comptroller-finance, city school superintendent, and recreation differ in the reverse manner. The relatively small differences between certain sub-groups is caused by their being heterogeneous groups also. Society has not yet a clear conception of what is to be done in any class of positions, and consequently permits a great variety of men to engage in it. (Article contains tables and figures showing interest differences among public administrators.)—*Mildred I. Fahlen.*

Unsigned. **Survey of personnel testing practices.** *The Management Review* 36 (2) February, 1947: 81-82.—A field check on the use of personnel tests in industry made by the California Council of Personnel Management shows interesting data from 45 organizations representing many kinds of work. Although the tests were used most widely in the clerical field, other classifications in which they are found, in order of importance, are mechanical and



sales, supervisory, professional, and transportation and executive. Large percentages of the companies use tests when filling jobs with present employees, selecting trainees or apprentices, making promotions or upgrading, or when filling supervisory positions from the work force. Sixty-five per cent of the companies report a better batting average in predicting future success when personnel tests are installed. Forty-nine per cent report more productive employees; 20 per cent, reduced labor turnover; 20 per cent (plus 7 per cent possibly), less labor trouble; 16 per cent, a lower accident rate; and 40 per cent, insufficient experience to report conclusively in all these categories. The majority of the organizations surveyed installed, administered, scored and interpreted their own testing programs. Standard tests are used by 71 per cent of the companies, while 53 per cent use self-developed tests—a combination of the two also being common. Among the 53 different standard tests mentioned as being in actual use among the 45 companies, paper-and-pencil group tests are used much more than individual performance tests.—*Dorothy M. Wilson.*

### Service Ratings

**Cleeton, Glen U. Rating executive qualities.** *Personnel* 23 (5) March, 1947: 321-26.—Among the traits which are unquestionably involved in executive ability, the following can be rated with reasonable objectivity: (1) ability to make decisions, (2) ability to assume responsibility without undue strain, (3) sensitiveness to human traits and reactions, (4) personal habits, appearance, and manner that build and maintain confidence, (5) technical knowledge, experience, and training, (6) integrity, fairness, and sincerity, (7) forcefulness, energy, and perseverance, (8) ability to inspire, teach, and develop men, (9) power of analysis, discrimination of relative values, (10) open-mindedness, (11) tact and self-control, (12) health. The rating of executive qualities can be most effectively accomplished by the use of rating scales. In the rating of executives, several precautions are recommended. Raters should guard against the concomitant factor known as the "halo effect." Raters should guard against "stereotypes." Raters should be trained. Raters should be given an opportunity for supervised practice. Each person under observation should be rated by at least three raters. The rating plan should be "sold" to those on whom it is used as well as to those who do the rating. Ratings should be made periodically, not sporadically. Ratings should be reviewed, either by a superior, by a

personnel department representative, or by a reviewing committee. Ratings should be discussed with the ratee, preferably by a third party. Wherever possible, ratings should be checked against other available objective evidence. Persons applying the results of ratings should clearly recognize that ratings are only approximations. Raters should be reasonably well acquainted with the persons they are rating and the work which they do. (Article includes author-copyrighted example of executive rating scale with five categories of each of the traits listed above.)—*Boynton S. Kaiser.*

**Mahler, Walter R. Let's get more scientific in rating employees.** *Personnel* 23 (5) March, 1947: 310-20.—Top management in industry is becoming more and more aware of the need for systematic determination of the relative worth of employees to their organization. However, an intensive survey of industrial companies indicates that only one company in ten is satisfied with its employee rating plan. One uniform condition underlies most of the unsatisfactory rating plans: reliance on trial and error rather than on basic research, and upon expediency rather than sound policy determination. In order to make a rating plan successful, we must get more scientific in our rating. Of the four principal factors in such a program, the first is an understanding of rating fundamentals: the ability of the rater to make accurate and consistent judgments and his willingness to do so. The second factor is the application of a systematic procedure for the development of the program. Five basic steps are involved: establish the purpose, consider the components (e.g., type of rating, frequency of rating, and method of scoring), develop a tentative program, try out the program, and evaluate the results. The third factor is the selection of trained personnel to develop the program. The fourth factor is management support. Lack of support, symptomatic of most unsuccessful plans, may be a tacit indication of dissatisfaction with an inadequate plan. Management must, however, be aware that the development of a successful plan requires at least a year. There is a widespread feeling among employees that working harder on their jobs will not pay off in promotion or advancement. It is true that employee rating is only a partial answer to the development of incentive, but an employee rating program prepared with a scientific approach, a program which provides information on which to give recognition and reward to those employees who demonstrate greater effort, higher skill, and superior performance, can cer-

tainly be considered a step in the right direction.—*Bettie Juresco.*

### Employee Relations

Benge, Eugene J., and Copell, Don F. **Employee morale survey.** *Modern Management* 7 (1) January, 1947: 19-22.—A morale study was made recently in a manufacturing company to determine each employee's opinion on forty-eight different points and to obtain his suggestions and criticisms. The first twenty-eight items indicated the employee's reactions toward his job, his boss, and the company. Tabulations were computed as morale indices. The employees were then asked to vote in favor of, or against, twenty topics relating to company policies, activities, and personnel services. Results were expressed merely as percentage in favor of each subject. The heart of the tabulation procedure lies in the computation of the morale indices, which are weighted in accordance with the number of responses. These indices were analyzed, and comparison made between age groups, departments, plants, etc. The relationship between the average morale indices and age groups takes the U-shaped curve when plotted on a graph which is fundamental in morale survey work. Employees under 20 years of age have high morale; those between 20 and 29 years of age, low morale. After this minimum, morale rises again with each successive age grouping. Normally, the same situation is encountered when considering length of service. Another breakdown of the morale indices was made, showing the results by individual departments. Thus, each supervisor had before him a picture of the attitude of his employees toward him and his performance, and the feeling of his men toward the company. Many suggestions for improving employee relations, working conditions, and operations were obtained from the questionnaire. The company reported to all personnel the outcome of the morale survey and made definite promises pertaining to pending physical changes which would eliminate undesirable working conditions. Nine months after the initial report, more than 70 per cent of the promises have been complied with. There has been a definite improvement in morale at most of the plants, as indicated by production reports and by a decrease in legitimate grievances.—*William C. Rogers.*

Nolting, Orin F. **Management policy on employee relations.** *Public Management* 29 (1) January, 1947: 5-10.—An organization chart on

the wall does not prove the existence of harmonious employee relations in an organization, nor does the formulation of personnel rules and regulations. Where employee reactions are disregarded, top management may expect organized expressions of dissatisfaction. In many cases this fact is not recognized by city officials until the organized employees challenge the administration to an accounting. A constructive and positive attitude toward employee relations is needed, with employee responsibility indicated by management. Employee organizations include: individual membership professional organizations; trades unions; general governmental employee unions; and services unions, such as fire-fighters, which may be affiliated. Employee organization objectives fall into a pattern including wages, working conditions, grievance handling plans, etc. The policy to be formulated depends on the method of organizational operation, which may include legislation, education, and/or negotiation, and discouragement or banning of strikes. Policy formulation can include (1) dealing with the employee only on an individual basis; (2) securing employee representation under official supervision; (3) an impartial dealing with individuals and/or union representatives speaking only for their own members; (4) dealing with organizational representatives chosen by a majority of the employees; (5) the "closed shop" approach, granting sole bargaining power to one union, with affiliation required before employment. Management will want to provide communication channels for recognition, which does not imply a contract. Written agreements are not necessary. Pressure on the employee to join a union in order to get or retain a job cannot be permitted. The strike weapon should be renounced. Organization by the employee should be open rather than secret. The policy will vary in accordance with the local public attitudes towards unionism. (Article contains some statistics regarding affiliation membership.)—*George A. Warren.*

### Public Relations

Custer, Richard H. **Trends in reporting to the public.** *Public Management* 29 (2) February, 1947: 40-43.—An International City Managers' Association questionnaire recently answered by 92 representative cities reveals that in 1946, annual municipal reports were used with increased effectiveness as a means of acquainting citizens with local government affairs. In addition to annual reports, many cities also used pamphlets, radio, and motion pictures in

in their information programs. Content and method of presentation of annual reports varied from stereotyped presentation of statistics on a department-by-department basis to highly readable reports written to highlight important facts and events. The latter made liberal use of graphic methods of presentation. Emphasis on readability appeared to be a growing trend. In distributing reports, smaller cities generally made more available, in proportion to population, and in 1946 increased their coverage over 1945. The larger cities issued fewer copies in proportion to population and also fewer than in 1945. In a representative city, one copy of the annual report was prepared for every ten citizens. On the average, reports were released ten weeks after the close of the year. Radio reporting increased noticeably in 1946, with utilization ranging from spot announcements to the broadcasting of council meetings. Movies were used primarily for dramatizing fire prevention activities. Pamphlets were effective in explaining particular phases of municipal activities, such as the source and distribution of tax revenues.—*Robert Culbertson*.

**Unsigned. Training municipal employees in public relations.** *Public Management* 29 (2) February, 1947: 47-50.—Because many city employees have contact with the public and such relations can be improved by training, several cities have established public relations training programs. Various training techniques are followed by four cities currently engaged in such programs. Jackson, Michigan, conducts ten two-hour conference meetings of three separate groups with a final dinner meeting of all three. These meetings are supervised by the personnel director. One session each is devoted to the following topics: public contacting, politeness and employee appearance, quality and quantity of information to be given to the public, complaints, speech, know your government, channels for influencing public opinion, building public employee morale, and telephone technique. In Kansas City, Missouri, public relations training has included the presentation of employees in a skit with subsequent criticism and evaluation by other participants in the program. Pasadena, California, plans to use the group discussion method, strip films, and practical demonstrations in a series of courtesy clinics. A local public relations firm conducted four training sessions of lectures and demonstrations for city employees in San Diego, California. San Diego recommends periodic repetition of this training as well as training for

supervisors of employees who handle the public.—*Patricia C. Livingston*.

### Seniority

**Unsigned. Current industrial seniority practices: a survey.** *The Management Review* 36 (2) February, 1947: 84-86.—There is impressive evidence that employees regard seniority as a major element in job security. In the worker's mind, seniority is an impersonal standard which minimizes possible employer discrimination. To further appraise the significance of seniority, the National Association of Manufacturers recently conducted a survey of seniority provisions in the collective bargaining agreements of 204 companies in 15 major industries. Agreements with CIO, AFL, and independent unions were studied. The following were among the findings obtained: (1) Only 23 per cent of the agreements provided for "straight" seniority; "ability" modified length of service in the majority of cases; (2) Seniority is used most commonly to determine order of layoff and rehiring, and is used frequently in promotion, demotion, and transfer; (3) The majority of agreements protect the seniority of employees who are absent for legitimate cause; (4) Among the common causes for loss of seniority are quitting, discharge, absence without leave, and failure to report on notification of work after layoff; and (5) Superseniority for union officials in the plant or company was the most prevalent type of special provision.—*Harry W. Johnstone*.

### Veterans' Preference

**Roher, Miriam. Veterans and the civil service.** *American Mercury* 63 (276) December, 1946: 689-95.—Pressure-conscious legislature are saddling the public service with bigger and better veterans preferences, thereby providing a new version of the spoils system. It is not so much a question of veterans beating out non-veterans as of veterans' preference beating out competent public administration, because not only the competent veteran but the mediocre one is pushed into office ahead of the able non-veteran. The first strike against the merit system in the federal civil service and most state and local systems is that everyone who has served in the armed services during wartime has 5 points added to his score, even if he fails. Strike two: disabled veterans get 10 points and are moved to the top of the eligible list, even when the disability is hay fever or dental trouble. Strike three: age, height, and weight requirements are waived for veterans and some openings are reserved exclusively for them. They also receive

preference over all others in reemployment and retention in jobs. Finally, when a veteran is passed over in selecting one of three top applicants, the appointing officer must give his reasons in writing to the civil service commission and to the veteran. While many capable veterans are seeking work, the full effects of the new laws will not be felt. They will have an increasing effect later, however, by giving preference to the misfits, failures, and dismissed veterans who increase in proportion to the number of veteran applicants as time goes on and block promotions to non-veterans and young applicants. To offset the handicaps of this special treatment, five steps can be taken: vigorous re-

cruitment of ex-servicemen to be sure the public service gets more of the able than the unable while the supply of job-seeking veterans is ample; on-the-job training to offset some of the loss of those scoring higher; placing a five year limit on the period of preference, as some states and cities have done; using the probationary period rigorously to weed out all incompetents; and setting admission requirements high enough for all comers so it is relatively safe to appoint anyone who passes the tests. Though such safeguards would not remove the element of unfairness to non-veterans, they at least would not be unfair to the administration of the government.—Mildred Stier.

# GOING TO DALLAS?

CIVIL SERVICE ASSEMBLY, NOV. 17-20

*Plan to travel on the famous*

## TEXAS SPECIAL » » » »

Daily crack luxury train, direct to the convention at Dallas and return. Fast, THROUGH car service to and from the Metropolitan East via St. Louis.



*Stop-overs arranged if you desire. Deluxe dining service, everything for your complete comfort and convenience en route.*

**E. A. Bohmeyer**  
PTM, Katy Lines  
St. Louis, Missouri

**E. G. Baker**  
PTM, Frisco Lines  
St. Louis, Missouri

*A New Edition of*

# MUNICIPAL PERSONNEL ADMINISTRATION

4TH EDITION, 1947

435PP., TABLES, CHARTS, CLOTHBOUND

Personnel administrators and city managers will find this new edition invaluable in helping to effect well-integrated personnel programs. This latest revision, prepared with the assistance of the Civil Service Assembly, brings the volume up to date and includes sections dealing with such timely problems as veterans' preference, employee organizations, dismissal procedure, retirement plans, and in-service training activities.

## *Contents*

- |   |  |
|---|--|
| I. The Personnel Problem                      | VIII. Employee Evaluation and Service Ratings                                |
| II. Organization for Personnel Administration | IX. Morale and Conditions of Employment                                      |
| III. Position-Classification                  | X. Discipline  |
| IV. Salary and Wage Standardization           | XI. Employee Relations   |
| V. Recruitment and Selection                  | XII. Retirement Systems  |
| VI. Employee Training                         | XIII. Special Administrative Problems  |
| VII. Promotion and Transfer                   | XIV. Guideposts for the Constructive Development of Personnel Administration |

*Municipal Personnel Administration* is a realistic, practical, down-to-earth guide prepared especially for municipal administrators and personnel officers. Its objective is to point the way to a workable solution of present-day personnel problems. Price of the text is \$7.50. For correspondence course with individualized lesson instruction, \$35.

## THE INSTITUTE FOR TRAINING IN MUNICIPAL ADMINISTRATION

*Conducted by*

**The International City Managers' Association**

1313 East 60th Street

Chicago 37, Illinois